

scribendum potius suadebo convertere: sed haec rara infelicitas erit.

- 50 Ceterum quantum natura studioque valeat memoria vel Themistocles testis, quem unum intra annum optime locutum esse Persice constat, vel Mithridates, cui duas et viginti linguas, quot nationibus imperabat, traditur notas fuisse, vel Crassus ille dives, qui cum Asiae praeesset quinque Graeci sermonis differentias sic tenuit ut qua quisque apud eum lingua postulasset eadem ius sibi redditum ferret, vel Cyrus, quem omnium militum tenuisse creditum
- 51 est nomina: quin semel auditos quamlibet multos versus protinus dicitur reddidisse Theodectes. Dicebantur etiam nunc esse qui facerent, sed mihi numquam ut ipse interesset contigit: habenda tamen fides est vel in hoc, ut qui crediderit et speret.

## 3

- 1 Pronuntiatio a plerisque actio dicitur, sed prius nomen a voce, sequens a gestu videtur accipere. Namque actionem Cicero alias 'quasi sermonem,' alias 'eloquentiam quandam corporis' dicit. Idem tamen duas eius partis facit,

<sup>21</sup> See Thucydides 1.138.1; Nepos, *Themistocles* 2.10; Plutarch, *Themistocles* 29.5; Valerius Maximus 8.7 ext. 15. These accounts vary a good deal.

<sup>22</sup> Compare, e.g., Aulus Gellius 17.17, Valerius Maximus 8.7 ext. 16. Cleopatra is also said to have needed no interpreters (Plutarch, *Antony* 27.3–4). It is interesting that Q. regards these linguistic achievements as a function of memory.

<sup>23</sup> Compare Valerius Maximus 8.7.6. The five dialects will be Attic, Ionic, Doric, Aeolic, and the "common dialect" (κοινή).

to give up pleading altogether, and, if he has any literary talent, turn it to writing. But this poverty of talent will be uncommon.

How much aptitude and application can do for memory is proved by Themistocles, who is known to have spoken excellent Persian within one year;<sup>21</sup> by Mithridates<sup>22</sup> who is said to have known twenty-two languages, as many as the nations over whom he ruled; by Crassus the Rich, who, as governor of Asia, had such mastery of the five dialects of Greek that he would give judgement in whatever language the case had been put forward;<sup>23</sup> and by Cyrus, who is believed to have known the names of all his soldiers.<sup>24</sup> Theodectes<sup>25</sup> too is said to have repeated off the cuff any number of verses which he had heard once. There were said to be people in our own time who could do this, but I never had the good fortune to witness it. We ought to believe it, however, simply because believing it gives us hope.

## CHAPTER 3

*Delivery*

*Pronuntiatio* is called *actio* by many people. It seems to have acquired the first name from its voice-element, the second from its element of gesture. Cicero<sup>1</sup> in one passage calls *actio* a "sort of language," and in another "a kind of el-

<sup>24</sup> Valerius Maximus 8.7 ext. 16. Xenophon's Cyrus also makes a point of addressing subordinates by name: e.g. *Cyropaedia* 2.2.28, 4.1.3. <sup>25</sup> See on 2.15.10, and compare Cicero, *Tusculanae Disputationes* 1.59. Theodectes may well have been an innovator in *memoria technica*: Blum (1969) 88–91.

<sup>1</sup> *De oratore* 3.222, *Orator* 55.

quae sunt eadem pronuntiationis, vocem atque motum: quapropter utraque appellatione indifferenter uti licet.

- 2 Habet autem res ipsa miram quandam in orationibus vim ac potestatem: neque enim tam refert qualia sint quae intra nosmet ipsos composuimus quam quo modo efferantur: nam ita quisque ut audit movetur. Quare neque probatio ulla, quae modo venit ab oratore, tam firma est ut non perdat vires suas nisi adiuvatur adseveratione dicentis, <et><sup>1</sup> adfectus omnes languescant necesse est, nisi voce,
- 3 vultu, totius prope habitu corporis inardescunt. Nam cum haec omnia fecerimus, felices tamen si nostrum illum ignem iudex conceperit, nedum eum supini securique moveamus ac non et ipse nostra oscitatione solvatur.
- 4 Documento sunt vel scaenici actores, qui et optimis poetarum tantum adiciunt gratiae ut nos infinito<sup>2</sup> magis eadem illa audita quam lecta delectent, et vilissimis etiam quibusdam impetrant aures, ut quibus nullus est in bibliothecis locus sit etiam frequens in theatris. Quod si in rebus quas fictas esse scimus et inanes tantum pronuntiatio potest ut iram lacrimas sollicitudinem adferat, quanto plus valeat necesse est ubi et credimus? Equidem vel mediocrem orationem commendatam viribus actionis adfirmari plus habituram esse momenti quam optimam eadem
- 6 illa destitutam: si quidem et Demosthenes, quid esset in toto dicendi opere primum interrogatus, pronuntiationi

<sup>1</sup> *add. edd.*      <sup>2</sup> *recc.: infinite B*

<sup>2</sup> I.e. no "technical," as opposed to "nontechnical," proof: see 5.1.      <sup>3</sup> Compare Cicero, *De oratore* 3.213, *Brutus* 142, *Orator* 56, [Plutarch], *Lives of the Ten Orators* 845B, Longinus, *Art of rhetoric* 195.5–9 Spengel–Hammer.

quence of the body." None the less, he divides *actio* into two elements, voice and movement, and these are also the elements of *pronuntiatio*. So we are free to use both names indifferently.

The thing itself has an extraordinary force and power in oratory. Indeed, it matters less what sort of things we have composed within ourselves than how we utter them, because people are affected according to what they hear. So there is no Proof—at least no Proof depending on the orator<sup>2</sup>—which is so secure that it does not lose its force unless it is assisted by the assurance of the speaker. Again, all emotions inevitably languish, unless they are kindled into flame by voice, face, and the bearing of virtually the whole body. Even when we have done all this, we shall be lucky if the judge catches our fire; if we sit back and take no trouble, of course, we cannot possibly move him, or stop *our* drowsiness from making *him* lose interest.

Stage actors demonstrate this. They add so much charm to the greatest poets that their productions give us infinitely more pleasure when heard than when read, and at the same time they secure an audience even for some of the poorest, so that authors for whom the libraries have no room may often find a place on the stage. And if Delivery has this power to produce anger, tears, or anxiety over matters which we know to be fictitious and unreal, how much more powerful must it be when we really believe! I have no hesitation in saying that even a mediocre speech, made attractive by the power of Delivery, will carry more weight than the best speech deprived of this help. After all, when Demosthenes<sup>3</sup> was asked what was the most important thing in the whole business of oratory, he gave the prize to

- palnam dedit, eidemque secundum ac tertium locum, donec ab eo quaeri desineret, ut eam videri posset non praecipuam sed solam iudicasse (ideoque ipse tam diligenter apud Andronicum hypocriten studuit ut admirantibus eius orationem Rhodiis non inmerito Aeschines dixisse videatur: 'quid si ipsum audissetis?') et M. Cicero unam in dicendo actionem dominari putat. Hac Cn. Lentulum plus opinionis consecutum quam eloquentia tradit, eadem C. Gracchum in deflenda fratris nece totius populi Romani lacrimas concitasse, Antonium et Crassum multum valuisse, plurimum vero Q. Hortensium. Cuius rei fides est, quod eius scripta tantum infra famam sunt, qua diu princeps orator, aliquando aemulus Ciceronis existimatus est, novissime, quoad vixit, secundus, ut appareat placuisse aliquid eo dicente quod legentes non invenimus. Et hercule cum valeant multum verba per se et vox propriam vim adiciat rebus et gestus motusque significet aliquid, profecto perfectum quiddam fieri cum omnia coierunt necesse est.
- 10 Sunt tamen qui rudem illam et qualem impetus cuiusque animi tulit actionem iudicent fortiolem et solam viris dignam, sed non alii fere quam qui etiam in dicendo curam

<sup>4</sup> So [Plutarch], *ibid.* 845A. Plutarch, *Demosthenes* 7 makes Satyrus the actor in question (Satyrus was a comic actor, Andronicus a tragic).

<sup>5</sup> Compare Cicero, *De oratore* 3.213. Pliny, *Epist.* 2.3, gives Aeschines' alleged words: τί δέ, εἰ αὐτοῦ τοῦ θηρίου ἡκούσατε; "What if you had heard the beast himself?" The "great speech" is *On the Crown*.

<sup>6</sup> *Brutus* 234; this Cn. Lentulus is the consul of 72 BC: *ORF* p. 337.

Delivery, and he gave it the second and the third place too, until they stopped asking; we must therefore suppose that he thought of it not just as the first faculty needed, but as the only one. (This is why he himself studied with such diligence under the actor Andronicus,<sup>4</sup> that, when the Rhodians admired the written version of his great speech, Aeschines is thought to have said (and very justifiably) "If only you had heard him in person!")<sup>5</sup> Likewise Cicero: he too thinks that Delivery has a unique dominance in oratory. He tells us that Gnaeus Lentulus got more reputation from this than from his eloquence,<sup>6</sup> that Gaius Gracchus moved the whole Roman people to tears by this means, when he wept for his brother's death,<sup>7</sup> and that Antonius and Crassus were very strong in this way, but Quintus Hortensius strongest of all.<sup>8</sup> This is supported by the fact that Hortensius' written works are far from justifying the reputation which caused him to be long regarded as the leading orator, then for a time as Cicero's rival, and finally, for the rest of his life, as second only to Cicero. There must obviously have been some attractions in his speaking which we do not find when we read him. Indeed, since words are very powerful by themselves, and the voice adds its own contribution to the content, and gestures and movements have a meaning, then, when they all come together, the result must be perfection.

However, there are those who think that raw delivery, such as is produced by the impulse of a person's feelings, is stronger, and is in fact the only kind worthy of a real man. These are in general the same people who habitually dis-

<sup>7</sup> *De oratore* 3.214. <sup>8</sup> *Brutus* 141, 158, 303. Cicero's best tribute to Hortensius is in *Brutus* 319–328.

- et artem et nitorem et quidquid studio paratur ut adfectata et parum naturalia solent improbare, vel qui verborum atque ipsius etiam soni rusticitate, ut L. Cottam dicit Cicero fecisse, imitationem antiquitatis adfectant. Verum illi persuasione sua fruuntur, qui hominibus ut sint oratores satis putant nasci: nostro labori dent veniam, qui nihil credimus esse perfectum nisi ubi natura cura iuvetur. In hoc igitur non contumaciter consentio, primas partis esse naturae. Nam certe bene pronuntiare non poterit cui aut in scriptis memoria aut in iis quae subito dicenda erunt facilitas prompta defuerit, nec si inemendabilia oris incommoda obstabunt. Corporis etiam potest esse aliqua tanta deformitas ut nulla arte vincatur. Sed ne vox quidem nisi libera vitiis<sup>3</sup> actionem habere optimam potest. Bona enim firmaque ut volumus uti licet: mala vel inbecilla et inhibet multa, ut insurgere exclamare, et aliqua cogit, ut intermittere<sup>4</sup> et deflectere et raras fauces ac latus fatigatum deformi cantico reficere. Sed nos de eo nunc loquamur cui non frustra praecipitur.
- 14 Cum sit autem omnis actio, ut dixi, in duas divisa partis, vocem gestumque, quorum alter oculos, altera aures movet, per quos duos sensus omnis ad animum penetrat adfectus, prius est de voce dicere, cui etiam gestus accomodatur.

<sup>3</sup> nisi libera vitiis *Winterbottom*: nisi liberalis *B*: exilis *b*

<sup>4</sup> summittere *B* ('lower')

<sup>9</sup> *De oratore* 3.42, *Brutus* 137; this L. Aurelius Cotta was tribune in 103 BC.

approve of care, art, polish, and any product of study in oratory, as being affected and unnatural, or who claim to imitate antiquity by a rustic vocabulary or even pronunciation, as Cicero says Lucius Cotta did.<sup>9</sup> Well, let them keep their opinion that to be born is enough to make a man an orator; but I hope they will pardon the efforts of those of us who think that nothing comes to perfection unless nature is assisted by art.<sup>10</sup> Still, as regards Delivery, I am not obstinate: I agree that nature has the main part. Certainly, no one can have a good Delivery who lacks either the power to memorize his written text or a ready facility for speaking impromptu, or who has an incurable speech defect. Some physical deformities also may be beyond the power of art to overcome. Indeed, unless the voice is free of defect, it cannot produce the best Delivery. A good firm voice can be used as we please; a poor or weak one inhibits many effects (for example, a crescendo or a loud cry) and forces us to do things like breaking off, lowering the pitch, or refreshing a hoarse throat or weary lungs by some hideous sing-song. But let us now speak about the person on whom advice is not wasted.

Delivery, taken as a whole, is divided, as I said, into two parts, voice and gesture. One appeals to the eye, the other to the ear; the two senses by which all emotion penetrates to the mind. We must first speak about voice, to which gesture also has to conform.

<sup>10</sup> Compare "Longinus" 2.1: *μία τέχνη πρὸς αὐτὸ τὸ πεφυκέναι*, "the only art to ensure <sublimity> is to be born to it"; *ibid.* 36.4 *ἢ γὰρ ἀλληλουχία τούτων ἴσως γένοιτ' ἂν τὸ τέλειον*, "The cooperation of these (*sc.* art and nature) may well produce perfection."

In ea prima observatio est qualem habeas, secunda quo modo utaris.

- 15 Natura vocis spectatur quantitate et qualitate. Quantitas simplicior: in summam enim grandis aut exigua est, sed inter has extremitates mediae sunt species et ab ima ad summam ac retro sunt multi gradus. Qualitas magis varia. Nam est et candida et fusca, et plena et exilis, et levis et aspera, et contracta et fusa, et dura et flexibilis, et clara et optusa. Spiritus etiam longior breviorque. Nec causas cur quidque eorum accadat persequi proposito operi necessarium est—eorumne sit differentia in quibus aura illa concipitur, an eorum per quae velut organa meat: ipsi propria natura, an prout movetur: lateris pectorisve firmitas an capitis etiam plus adiuvet. Nam opus est omnibus, sicut non oris modo suavitate sed narium quoque, per quas quod superest vocis egeritur, dulcis sit<sup>5</sup> [tamen]<sup>6</sup> non exprobrans<sup>7</sup> sonus.
- 17 Utendi voce multiplex ratio. Nam praeter illam differentiam quae est tripartita, acutae gravis flexae, tum intentis tum remissis, tum elatis tum inferioribus modis opus
- 18 est, spatiis quoque lentioribus aut citatioribus. Sed his ipsis media interiacent multa, et ut facies, quamquam ex paucissimis constat, infinitam habet differentiam, ita vox, etsi paucas quae nominari possint continet species, propria

<sup>5</sup> *Halm*: esse *B*: esse tamen <debet> *recc*.

<sup>6</sup> *del. Winterbottom*

<sup>7</sup> *exprobratus Murgia, exprobrandus M.W.*

<sup>11</sup> See Aristotle, *De anima* 2.11. 422b28–31 for a similar list of “opposites” in voice-quality. <sup>12</sup> See on 1.5.22–24.

*Quality and use of voice*

The first consideration is the nature of a person’s voice, the second its use.

(1) The nature of the voice is seen in terms of volume and quality. Volume is simpler: in brief, the voice is either strong or weak, though there are intermediate kinds between these extremes, and many degrees between the top and the bottom of this scale. Quality is more complex. A voice may be clear or husky, full or thin, smooth or harsh, limited or rich, hard or flexible, resonant or dull.<sup>11</sup> The breathing too may be longer or shorter. It is not necessary for our present purpose to investigate the causes of all these variations—whether the difference lies in the part of the body where the breath is formed, or in the pipes, as it were, through which it passes; whether the voice has a nature of its own or just reacts to movements; and whether strength of lungs or chest or even head does more to help it. All in fact are needed, and not only a sweet oral tone: the sound produced by the nose, through which the residue of the voice is expelled, should also be agreeable and not grating.

(2) The use of the voice has many aspects. Apart from the threefold division into Acute, Grave and Circumflex,<sup>12</sup> we also need intonations which are from time to time intense or relaxed, higher or lower, and in slower or in quicker time. Between these extremes themselves there are many intermediate stages; just as the face, though made up of very few features, possesses infinite variety, so it is with the voice: there are few varieties to which we can give a name, yet every individual has his own special voice,

cuique est, et non haec minus auribus quam oculis illa dinoscitur.

- 19 Augentur autem sicut omnium, ita vocis quoque bona cura, neglegentia vel inscitia<sup>8</sup> minuuntur. Sed cura non eadem oratoribus quae phonascis convenit, tamen multa sunt utrisque communia: firmitas corporis, ne ad spadonum et mulierum et aegrorum exilitatem vox nostra tenuetur, quod ambulatio, unctio, veneris abstinencia, facilis ciborum digestio, id est frugalitas, praestat; praeterea ut sint fauces integrae, id est molles ac leves, quarum vitio et frangitur et obscuratur et exasperatur et scinditur vox. Nam ut tibiae eodem spiritu accepto alium clusis alium apertis foraminibus, alium non satis purgatae alium quassae sonum reddunt, ita<sup>9</sup> fauces tumentes strangulant vocem, optusae obscurant, rasae exasperant, convulsae fractis sunt organis similes. Finditur etiam spiritus obiectu aliquo, sicut lapillo tenues aquae, quarum cursus<sup>10</sup> etiam si ultra paulum coit, aliquid tamen cavi relinquit post id ipsum quod offenderat. Umore quoque vocem ut nimius impedit, ita consumptus destituit. Nam fatigatio, ut corpora, non ad praesens modo tempus sed etiam in futurum adficit.
- 22 Sed ut communiter et phonascis et oratoribus necessaria est exercitatio, qua omnia convalescunt, ita curae non

<sup>8</sup> vel inscitia J: vel scitia B: del. b      <sup>9</sup> b: item B

<sup>10</sup> Spalding: spiritus B: impetus Winterbottom

<sup>13</sup> For the use of the *phonascus* (see 2.8.15) to check and correct speech, compare Suetonius, *Augustus* 84, *Nero* 25. Q. here indicates that this teacher must also set an example.

and this distinctiveness is as obvious to the ear as the distinctiveness of the face is to the eye.

The good qualities of the voice, as of everything else, are improved by training and impaired by neglect or lack of knowledge. But the proper regime for the orator is not that of the voice-trainer,<sup>13</sup> though these two professions have many needs in common: first, a robust physique, to save the voice from dwindling to the feeble shrillness of eunuchs, women, and invalids (this can be assured by walking, rubbing with oil, sexual abstinence, and easy digestion—in other words, a frugal life);<sup>14</sup> and secondly, a healthy throat—that is to say a soft and smooth one—for any defect here produces a voice which is broken, muffled, harsh, or cracked. This is because, just as pipes produce various sounds from the same volume of breath, according to whether the apertures are closed or open or the instrument clogged or cracked, so also a swollen throat stifles the voice, a blocked throat muffles it, inflammation makes it hoarse, and strain can disrupt it like a broken set of pipes. The breath may also be divided by some obstacle, as a little stream is by a stone, where the current may indeed reunite a little further on, but leaves an empty space in the rear of the obstacle itself. Excess of moisture impedes the voice; total loss of moisture destroys it. Fatigue affects the voice (as it does the body in general) not only at the moment of exertion, but also later on.

Thus exercise, which gives everything strength, is necessary for voice-trainers and for orators alike; but they need different kinds of regime. A man who is occupied

<sup>14</sup> Compare the advice on the healthy man's regime given by Celsus, *De medicina* 1.1.

- idem genus est. Nam neque certa tempora ad spatiandum dari possunt tot civilibus officiis occupato, nec praeparare ab imis sonis vocem ad summos nec semper a contentione condere licet, cum pluribus iudiciis saepe dicendum sit.
- 23 Ne ciborum quidem est eadem observatio: non enim tam molli teneraque voce quam forti ac durabili opus est, cum illi omnes etiam altissimos sonos leniant cantu oris, nobis pleraque aspere sint concitateque dicenda et vigilandae noctes et fuligo lucubrationum bibenda et in sudata veste
- 24 durandum. Quare vocem deliciis non molliamus, nec inbuatur ea consuetudine quam desideratura sit, sed exercitatio eius talis sit qualis usus, nec silentio subsidat, sed firmetur consuetudine, qua difficultas omnis levatur.
- 25 Ediscere autem quo exercearis erit optimum (nam ex tempore dicentis avocat a cura vocis ille qui ex rebus ipsis concipitur adfectus), et ediscere quam maxime varia, quae et clamorem et disputationem et sermonem et flexus
- 26 habeant, ut simul in omnia paremur. Hoc satis est. Alioqui nitida illa et curata vox insolitum laborem recusabit, ut adsueta gymnasiis et oleo corpora, quamlibet sint in suis certaminibus speciosa atque robusta, si militare iter facemque et vigilias imperes, deficient et quaerant unctores
- 27 suos nudumque sudorem. Illa quidem in hoc opere praecipui quis ferat, vitandos soles atque ventos et nubila etiam ac siccitates? Ita, si dicendum in sole aut ventoso umido cali-

<sup>15</sup> Compare Cicero, *De oratore* 1.251.

with many public duties cannot allot fixed times for going for a walk, or tune his voice through the whole scale from bottom to top or always protect it from strain, because he often has to speak in several trials.<sup>15</sup> Even the dietary rules are different. What we need is not so much a flexible and delicate voice as a strong and durable one; the voice-trainer softens all sounds, even the highest, by his vocal modulation, whereas we often have to speak in harsh, agitated tones, spend wakeful nights, imbibe the soot of mid-night lamps, and persevere when our clothes are soaked in sweat. So let us not soften our voice by coddling, nor accustom it to habits which it is going to miss; let its exercise be like its real use; let it not fade away in silence, but be strengthened by habit, by which all difficulties are made easy.

The best thing will be to learn practice passages by heart (because, in extempore speaking, emotional involvement in the actual content is a distraction from the care of the voice) and to learn passages which are as varied as possible, involving shouting, arguing, talking normally, and using the inflexions of the voice, so that we can be prepared for all contingencies by a single exercise. This is enough. If you go further, your beautiful, overtrained voice will refuse any unusual exertion, just as people whose bodies are accustomed to the gymnasia and the oil-treatments, however handsome and strong they are in their specialized sport, would soon give up and ask for their masseurs and a chance to sweat naked, if you ordered them to march with the troops, carry a full pack, and do guard duties. It would surely be intolerable if, in a work like this, I recommended avoiding exposure to sun and wind, and even cloudy or dry weather. Are we to abandon our clients if we have to speak

do die fuerit, reos deseremus? Nam crudum quidem aut saturum aut ebrium aut eiecto modo vomitu, quae cavenda quidam monent, <vel><sup>11</sup> declamare neminem qui sit mentis compos puto.

- 28 Illud non sine causa est ab omnibus praeceptum, ut parcat maxime voci in illo a pueritia in adolescentiam transitu, quia naturaliter impeditur, non, ut arbitror, propter calorem, quod quidam putaverunt (nam est maior alias), sed propter umorem potius: nam hoc aetas illa turgescit. Itaque nares etiam ac pectus eo tempore tument, atque omnia velut germinant eoque sunt tenera et iniuria obnoxia.

Sed, ut ad propositum redeam, iam confirmatae constitutaeque voci genus exercitationis optimum duco quod est operi simillimum, dicere cotidie sicut agimus. Namque hoc modo non vox tantum confirmatur et latus, sed etiam corporis decens et accommodatus orationi motus componitur.

- 30 Non alia est autem ratio pronuntiationis quam ipsius orationis. Nam ut illa emendata dilucida ornata apta esse debet, ita haec quoque. Emendata erit, id est vitio carebit, si fuerit os facile explanatum iucundum urbanum, id est in quo nulla neque rusticitas neque peregrinitas resonet.

<sup>11</sup> *add. M.W.*

<sup>16</sup> Aristotle discusses the voice change in boys at puberty, *Historia animalium* 5. 544b24, 7. 581a15, *De generatione animalium* 776b15, 788a1. Let us recall that Q.'s pupils were mostly adolescents, between 13 and 18.

<sup>17</sup> The "virtues" of oratorical speech have been discussed in this order in 8.1–11.1.

on a sunny, windy, wet, or warm day? As for the warning which some think necessary, not to speak if you have indigestion or have over-eaten or are drunk or have just vomited—no sane person surely would <so much as> declaim in such a condition!

On the other hand, there is good reason for the advice, universally given, to spare the voice as much as possible in the transition from boyhood to adolescence, because at that stage it has natural difficulties—not, I fancy, because of heat, as some have thought (there is more heat at other periods), but rather because of the moisture which swells up at that age. Nostrils and chest therefore swell at this time; everything is burgeoning, as it were, and so is tender and liable to damage.<sup>16</sup>

#### *Four features of good Delivery*

But, to return to our main purpose, the kind of exercise I think best for the voice, once it has strengthened and settled down, is that which is most like real work, namely to speak every day in the way we do in court. In this way, not only are the voice and lungs strengthened, but we acquire decorous bodily movements suited to our style of speaking.

Not that there is any difference between the principles of Delivery and those of oratorical speech itself. Speech must be correct, lucid, ornate, and appropriate,<sup>17</sup> and so too must Delivery. (1) This will be correct, that is to say free of fault, if (a) the accent is easy, clear, pleasant, and of the city—that is, free from any trace of rusticity or foreign-



- 31 Non enim sine causa dicitur barbarum Graecumve: nam sonis homines ut aera tinnitu dinoscimus. Ita fiet illud quod Ennius probat cum dicit 'suaviloquenti ore' Cethegum fuisse, non quod Cicero in iis reprehendit quos ait latrare, non agere. Sunt enim multa vitia, de quibus dixi cum in quadam primi libri parte puerorum ora formarem, oportunius ratus in ea aetate facere illorum mentionem in qua emendari possunt. Itemque si ipsa vox primum fuerit, ut sic dicam, sana, id est nullum eorum de quibus modo retuli patietur incommodum, deinde non subsurda rudis inmanis dura rigida rauca<sup>12</sup> praepinguis, aut tenuis inanis acerba pusilla mollis effeminata, spiritus nec brevis nec parum durabilis nec in receptu difficilis.
- 33 Dilucida vero erit pronuntiatio primum si verba tota exierint, quorum pars devorari, pars destitui solet, plerisque extremas syllabas non perferentibus dum priorum sono indulgent. Ut est autem necessaria verborum explanatio, ita omnis inputare et velut adnumerare litteras molestum et odiosum: nam et vocales frequentissime coeunt et consonantium quaedam insequente vocali dissimulantur. Utriusque exemplum posuimus: 'multum ille et terris.'
- 35 Vitatur etiam duriorum inter se congressus, unde 'pellexit'

<sup>12</sup> Wilson: vana B: rava or vasta Burman

<sup>18</sup> The noun understood with *barbarum* and *Graecum* is *os*. There is no other evidence for this as a proverb or common saying, but it is probably Greek in origin and applies originally to Greek pronunciation: the Greeks divided all mankind into "Greek" and "barbarian" (Cicero, *De republica* 1.58).

<sup>19</sup> Ennius, *Annales* 304–305 Vahlen = 300 Warmington (*ROL* 2. 112) = 304–308 Skutsch: from Cicero, *Brutus* 58.

ness. (There is good ground for the common description of an accent as "barbarian or Greek,"<sup>18</sup> since we distinguish men by their voices as we do bronze by its ring.) This is how to achieve the quality Ennius approves when he says that Cethegus had a "sweet-speaking mouth,"<sup>19</sup> and avoid what Cicero criticizes in those who, he says, "don't plead, but bark."<sup>20</sup> (There are in fact many faults, which I spoke of in the part of Book One in which I dealt with forming the speech of children,<sup>21</sup> because I thought it better to mention them in connection with an age when they could still be put right.) Again (b) correctness is achieved if the voice itself is, first, healthy (as one might say), that is to say without any of the defects I have mentioned; and, secondly, if it is not, on the one hand, dull, ill-formed, coarse, hard, stiff, hoarse, or thick, or, on the other hand, thin, empty, grating, feeble, soft, or effeminate, and if the breath is not short, hard to sustain, or difficult to recover.

(2) Delivery will be lucid, if (a) in the first place, the words are pronounced in full, not (as so often) partly swallowed or clipped; many people fail to carry through the final syllables because they over-emphasize the earlier ones. However, though words must be pronounced in full, it is tiresome and offensive to put a value on every letter and, as it were, make a separate item of it. For one thing, vowels often coalesce and some consonants are suppressed when a vowel follows. My previous example, *multum ille et terris*,<sup>22</sup> illustrates both points. Combinations of harder consonants are also avoided: hence *pellexit*,

<sup>20</sup> Cicero, loc. cit.

<sup>21</sup> 1.11.

<sup>22</sup> *Aeneid* 1.3 (*multum ille et*); compare 9.4.40.

et 'collegit' et quae alio loco dicta sunt. Ideoque laudatur in Catulo suavis appellatio litterarum. Secundum est ut sit oratio distincta, id est, qui dicit et incipiat ubi oportet et desinat. Observandum etiam quo loco sustinendus et quasi suspendendus sermo sit, quod Graeci ὑποδιαστολήν vel ὑποστιγμήν vocant, quo deponendus. Suspenditur  
 36 'arma virumque cano,' quia illud 'virum' ad sequentia pertinet, ut sit 'virum Troiae qui primus ab oris,' et hic iterum. Nam etiam si aliud est unde venit quam quo venit, non distinguendum tamen, quia utrumque eodem verbo continetur 'venit.' Tertio 'Italiam,' quia interiectio est 'fato profugus' et continuum sermonem, qui faciebat 'Italiam Lavinaque,' dividit. Ob eandemque causam quarto 'profugus,' deinde 'Lavinaque venit litora,' ubi iam erit distinctio, quia inde alius incipit sensus. Sed in ipsis etiam distinctionibus tempus alias brevius, alias longius dabitur: interest enim sermonem finiant an sensum. Itaque illam distinctionem 'litora' protinus altero spiritus initio insequar; cum illuc venero: 'atque altae moenia Romae,' deponam et morabor et novum rursus exordium faciam.  
 37  
 38  
 39 Sunt aliquando et sine respiratione quaedam morae etiam in perihodis. Ut enim illa 'in coetu vero populi Ro-

<sup>23</sup> Compare 1.5.69 (?); 9.4.37–38 (?).

<sup>24</sup> *Brutus* 259.

<sup>25</sup> The learned and cultivated consul of 102 BC: see *De oratore* 2.28, 151; *Pro Archia* 6; *ORF* pp. 218–220.

<sup>26</sup> Q. treats these terms as equivalent, but Greek usage applies ὑποδιαστολή to individual words, ὑποστιγμή to phrases or commata (LSJ ss.vv.).

<sup>27</sup> Q. now bases his lesson on *Aeneid* 1.1–3.

<sup>28</sup> *Aeneid* 1.7, followed (as Q. says) by a fresh start: *Musa, mihi causas memora* . . . ("Muse, relate to me the causes . . .").

*collegit*, and the others mentioned elsewhere.<sup>23</sup> It is in this connection that Cicero<sup>24</sup> praises Catulus<sup>25</sup> for his "sweet pronunciation of letters." (b) Secondly, speech must be distinct, that is to say the speaker must begin and stop at the right place. We must also note where our speech should be held up and as it were left in the air (the Greeks call this *hypodiasistolē* or *hypostigmē*),<sup>26</sup> and where it should be brought to rest. *Arma virumque cano* ("Arms and the man I sing")<sup>27</sup> is left in the air, because *virum* belongs to what follows, giving us *virum Troiae qui primus ab oris* ("the man who first from the shores of Troy"), after which there is another suspension; for, although where he came from and where he arrived are two different things, yet we do not need punctuation here, because both are covered by the same verb, *venit* ("came"). There is a third pause at *Italiam*, because *fato profugus* ("exiled by fate") is parenthetical and interrupts the continuity of *Italiam Lavinaque*. For the same reason, there is a fourth pause at *profugus*, after which comes *Lavinaque venit litora* ("and came to Lavinian shores"), where we do at last need punctuation, because a new sentence begins from this point. Even when there is punctuation, the time we give to it may be shorter or longer, according to whether it marks the end of a phrase or of a thought. Thus I shall take a new breath immediately after the punctuation at *litora*, but when I come to *atque altae moenia Romae* ("and the walls of lofty Rome"),<sup>28</sup> I shall pause and wait and make a fresh beginning.

Pauses sometimes occur, even in periods, without a new breath. The sentence beginning *in coetu vero populi*

mani, negotium publicum gerens, magister equitum' et cetera multa membra habent (sensus enim sunt alii atque alii) sed unam circumductionem: ita paulum morandum in his intervallis, non interruptendus est contextus. Et e contrario spiritum interim recipere sine intellectu morae necesse est, quo loco quasi surripiendus est: alioqui si incite recipiatur, non minus adferat obscuritatis quam vitiosa distinctio. Virtus autem distinguendi fortasse sit parva, sine qua tamen esse nulla alia in agendo potest.

40 Ornata est pronuntiatio cui suffragatur vox facilis magna beata flexibilis firma dulcis durabilis clara pura, secans aëra et auribus sedens (est enim quaedam ad auditum accommodata non magnitudine sed proprietate), ad hoc velut tractabilis, utique habens omnes in se qui desiderantur sinus intentionesque et toto, ut aiunt, organo instructa, cui aderit lateris firmitas, spiritus cum spatio pertinax, tum labori non facile cessurus.

41 Neque gravissimus autem [in musica]<sup>13</sup> sonus nec acutissimus orationibus convenit: nam et hic parum clarus nimiumque plenus nullum adferre animis motum potest, et ille praetenuis et inmodicae claritatis cum est ultra verum, tum neque pronuntiatione flecti neque diutius ferre  
42 intentionem potest. Nam vox, ut nervi, quo remissior hoc gravior et plenior, quo tensior hoc tenuis et acuta magis

<sup>13</sup> *del. Winterbottom*

<sup>29</sup> Cicero, *Philippics* 2.63 (compare, e.g., 5.10.99, 8.4.8): "in the assembly of the Roman people, doing public business, as Master of the Horse."

<sup>30</sup> Gesner explained that Q. has in mind a hydraulic organ, the

*Romani, negotium publicum gerens, magister equitum*,<sup>29</sup> and so on, has many Cola (there are a number of thoughts, one after another) but only one Period; so it is a case for short pauses between these phrases, not for breaking up the structure of the whole. Conversely, it is sometimes necessary to recover breath without a perceptible pause, in which case it has to be snatched surreptitiously, because if we regain our breath awkwardly, this produces just as much obscurity as faulty punctuation. Virtue of punctuation is perhaps a small thing; but without it there can be no other virtue in a pleading.

(3) Delivery is "ornate" when it is supported by a voice which is fluent, strong, rich, flexible, firm, sweet, durable, clear, pure, cutting through the air and settling in the ear (there is a type of voice well adapted to being heard not because of its volume but because of its special quality), and also, as it were, manageable, having of course all the necessary inflexions and tensions, and being equipped, as they say, with "all the stops."<sup>30</sup> There must also be strength in the lungs, and breath that both holds out well and will not easily give way to fatigue.

Neither the deepest nor the highest notes [in music] suit oratory. The lowest notes are indistinct and too full, and cannot impart any emotion to the mind; on the other hand, the very thin and exaggeratedly clear are both beyond the normal range and incapable of variation in Delivery or of bearing strain very long. The voice is indeed like the strings of an instrument: the slacker it is, the deeper and fuller it is; the tighter it is, the thinner and shriller it is.

invention of Ctesibius (described by Vitruvius 10.13), and this complicated instrument was familiar in Q.'s time.

est. Sic ima vim non habet, summa rumpi periclitatur. Mediis ergo utendum sonis, hique tum augenda intentione excitandi, tum summittenda sunt temperandi.

- 43 Nam prima est observatio recte pronuntiandi aequalitas, ne sermo subsultet inparibus spatiis ac sonis, miscens longa brevibus, gravia acutis, elata summissis, et inaequalitate horum omnium sicut pedum claudicet. Secunda varietas: [quod solum est pronuntiatio]<sup>14</sup> ac ne quis pugnare inter se putet aequalitatem et varietatem, cum illi virtuti contrarium vitium sit inaequalitas, huic quae dicitur *μονοειδέα*, quasi quidam unus aspectus. Ars porro variandi cum gratiam praebet ac renovat aures, tum dicentem ipsa laboris mutatione reficit, ut standi ambulandi sedendi iacendi vices sunt nihilque eorum pati unum diu possumus.
- 45 Illud vero maximum (sed id paulo post tractabimus), quod secundum rationem rerum de quibus dicimus animorumque habitus conformanda vox est, ne ab oratione discordet. Vitemus igitur illam quae Graece *μονοτονία* vocatur, una quaedam spiritus ac soni intentio, non solum ne dicamus omnia clamose, quod insanum est, aut intra loquendi modum, quod motu caret, aut summisso murmure,
- 46 quo etiam debilitatur omnis intentio, sed ut in isdem partibus isdemque adfectibus sint tamen quaedam non ita

<sup>14</sup> *del. M.W.*: qua salem habet pronuntiatio *Shackleton Bailey* ('in which Delivery has its wit')

<sup>31</sup> 11.3.61.

Thus at the bottom of the scale it has no force, while at the top it is in danger of cracking. It is therefore the intermediate sounds that must be used, and these must be raised when the tension is to be increased, and lowered when it is to be relaxed.

The first rule of correct Delivery is evenness. Speech must not be jerky, with irregular intervals and sounds, making a confusion of long and short, grave and acute, high and low; nor must it limp along, owing to the unevenness of all these elements—the “feet,” as it were, on which it walks. The second requirement is variety [and this in fact is all there is to Delivery]. One should not think that evenness and variety are incompatible; the vice corresponding to the virtue of evenness is unevenness, the vice corresponding to variety is *monoeideia*, a “uniform appearance,” as it were. Moreover, the art of variation both gives pleasure and refreshment to the audience and revives the speaker by giving him a change of work—just as standing, walking, sitting, and lying down are things we do by turns, and we cannot bear to do any one of them for a long time.

The most important point (but I will deal with it a little later)<sup>31</sup> is that the voice must be adapted to the nature of the subject of which we are speaking and of the feelings involved, so as not to be out of harmony with our words. We should therefore avoid what the Greeks call *monotonia*, a single uniform tension of breath and voice. I do not merely mean that we should avoid saying everything at the top of our voice (that would be sheer lunacy) or saying everything in a conversational tone (this has no emotional impact) or always mumbling (which loses the tension altogether): I mean that within single passages of the same emotional tone there should nevertheless be some modulations of

magnae vocis declinationes, prout aut verborum dignitas aut sententiarum natura aut depositio aut inceptio aut transitus postulabit: ut qui singulis pinxerunt coloribus, alia tamen eminentiora alia reductiora fecerunt, sine quo ne membris quidem suas lineas dedissent.

- 47 Proponamus enim nobis illud Ciceronis in oratione nobilissima pro Milone principium: nonne ad singulas paene distinctiones quamvis in eadem facie tamen quasi vultus mutandus est? 'Etsi vereor, iudices, ne turpe sit pro fortis-
- 48 simo viro dicere incipientem timere': etiam si est toto proposito contractum atque summissum, quia et exordium est et solliciti exordium, tamen fuerit<sup>15</sup> necesse est aliquid plenius et erectius cum<sup>16</sup> dicit 'pro fortissimo viro' quam cum
- 49 'etsi vereor' et 'turpe sit' et 'timere.' Iam secunda respiratio increseat oportet et naturali quodam conatu, quo minus pavide dicimus quae secuntur, et quod magnitudo animi Milonis ostenditur: 'minimeque deceat, cum Titus Annius ipse magis de rei publicae salute quam de sua perturbetur.' Deinde quasi obiurgatio sui est: 'me ad eius causam parem
- 50 animi magnitudinem adferre non posse.' Tum invidiosiora: 'tamen haec novi iudicii nova forma terret oculos.' Illa vero iam paene apertis, ut aiunt, tibiis: 'qui, quocumque inciderunt, consuetudinem fori et pristinum morem iudiciorum requirunt.' Nam sequens latum etiam atque fustum est: 'non enim corona consessus vester cinctus est, ut so-

<sup>15</sup> sonet *M.W.*: sonuerit *D.A.R.*

<sup>16</sup> *T.*: dum *B.*: sufocat *b*

<sup>32</sup> 1.

voice, not great, but such as are required by the dignity of the words, the nature of the thoughts, the ends, the beginnings, and the transitions. Artists who painted in a single colour nevertheless made some things stand out more than others, since otherwise they could not even have given proper outlines to the limbs of their figures.

Let us take as an example the beginning of Cicero's splendid *Pro Milone*.<sup>32</sup> Is it not clear that, at almost every stop, the *face* (as it were) stays the same, but its *expression* has to change? "Although I fear (*etsi vereor*), members of the jury (*iudices*), that it is discreditable (*ne turpe sit*), when beginning to speak on behalf of a very brave man (*pro fortissimo viro*), to feel afraid (*timere*). " Although the general tone of the passage is restrained and subdued (it is after all a Prooemium, and the Prooemium of a speaker conscious of his difficulties), nevertheless there must have been a fuller and prouder tone when he says *pro fortissimo viro* than when he says *turpe sit* or *timere*. The second breath has now to be stronger, both because of the natural effort which makes us speak the following words less timidly, and because Milo's courage is now to be shown: "and that it is very unbecoming, when Titus Annius is more troubled for the state's security than for his own . . ." Then comes a sort of self-reproach: "that I should be unable to offer courage equal to his to serve his Cause." And then something more hard-hitting: "Nevertheless, the unprecedented appearance of this unprecedented court strikes terror into my eyes." And now he opens practically every stop of his instrument: ". . . my eyes, which, wherever they fall, look in vain for the ordinary ways of the forum and the ancient procedures of our courts." What follows is positively ample and diffuse: "Your sitting is not, as it used to

- 51 lebat.' Quod notavi ut appareret non solum in membris  
causae sed etiam in articulis esse aliquam pronuntiandi  
varietatem, sine qua nihil neque maius neque minus est.  
Vox autem ultra vires urgenda non est: nam et suffoca-  
tur<sup>17</sup> saepe et maiore nisu minus clara est et interim elisa  
in illum sonum erumpit cui Graeci nomen a gallorum  
52 immaturo cantu dederunt. Nec volubilitate nimia confun-  
denda quae dicimus, qua et distinctio perit et adfectus,  
et nonnumquam etiam verba aliqua sui parte fraudantur.  
Cui contrarium est vitium nimiae tarditatis: nam et dif-  
ficultatem inveniendi fatetur et segnitia solvit animos, et,  
in quo est aliquid, temporibus praefinitis aquam perdit.  
Promptum sit os, non praeceps; moderatum, non lentum.  
53 Spiritus quoque nec crebro receptus concidat senten-  
tiam nec eo usque trahatur donec deficiat. Nam et defor-  
mis est consumpti illius sonus et respiratio sub aqua diu  
pressi similis et receptus longior et non oportunus, ut qui  
fiat non ubi volumus sed ubi necesse est. Quare longiorem  
dicturis perihodon colligendus est spiritus, ita tamen ut id  
neque diu neque cum sono faciamus, neque omnino ut  
manifestum sit: reliquis partibus optime inter iuncturas

<sup>17</sup> *edd.*: suffocat B: sufocat b

<sup>33</sup> Q. also has in mind the rest of the passage: "we are not surrounded by the usual throng; the guards you see in front of all the temples, though they are placed there to prevent violence, cannot fail to inspire some terror in the speaker . . ."

<sup>34</sup> Probably *κοκκυσμός* (a high-pitched note, see LSJ s.v.) rather than *κρωγμός* ("crowing") or *κλωγμός* ("clucking"). See also Juvenal 3.91.

<sup>35</sup> Speakers were commonly timed by the water clock (clepsy-

be, surrounded by a ring of spectators . . ."<sup>33</sup> I note all this, in order to make it clear that some variety of delivery is found not only in the longer units of the speech but also in the smaller ones, because without this nothing would seem either more or less important than anything else.

The voice must not be forced beyond its strength. On the one hand, it often chokes, and the increased effort simply makes it less clear; on the other, it sometimes breaks and emerges as the noise to which the Greeks give a name derived from the immature crowing of a cock.<sup>34</sup> We must beware too of confusing what we say by excessive volubility, which destroys both distinctness of phrasing and emotional effect, and sometimes even slurs over parts of words. The contrary vice is undue slowness; this is a confession of difficulty in Invention, destroys attention by its sluggishness, and (a not unimportant consideration) wastes water when we have been given a time limit.<sup>35</sup> Speech should be ready, it should not come tumbling out; it should be controlled, not sluggish.

As to breathing, we should not take a new breath so often that we break up the sense, nor yet hold our breath till it fails us, because the sound of the breath being expelled is unpleasant, the breathing becomes like that of a man who has been held under water for a while, and the fresh intake is long and ill-timed, since it happens when it must and not when we choose. So, when about to deliver a lengthy period, we should collect our breath, but not take a long time over it, do it noisily, or make it in any way obvious; at other points, the best plan will be to recover breath at the

dra) both in Greek and in Roman courts. See A. N. Sherwin-White on Pliny, *Epist.* 2.11.14.

- 54 sermonis revocabitur. Exercendus autem est ut sit quam longissimus: quod Demosthenes ut efficeret scandens in adversum continuabat quam posset plurimos versus. Idem quo facilius verba ore libero exprimeret, calculos lingua volvens dicere domi solebat.
- 55 Est interim et longus et plenus et clarus satis spiritus, non tamen firmæ intentionis ideoque tremulus, ut corpora quæ aspectu integra nervis parum sustinentur. Id *βρασμόν*<sup>18</sup> Graeci vocant. Sunt qui spiritum cum stridore per raritatem dentium non recipiunt sed resorbent. Sunt qui crebro anhelitu et introrsum etiam clare sonante imitentur iumenta onere et iugo laborantia: quod adfectant quoque, tamquam inventionis copia urgeantur maiorque vis eloquentiae ingruat quam quæ emitti faucibus possit. Est aliis concursus oris et cum verbis suis conluctatio. Iam tussire et expuere crebro et ab imo pulmone pituitam <vel-ut><sup>19</sup> trochleis adducere et oris umore proximos spargere et maiorem partem spiritus in loquendo per nares effundere, etiam si non utique vocis sunt vitia, quia tamen propter vocem accidunt potissimum huic loco subiciantur.
- 57 Sed quodcumque ex his vitium magis tulerim quam, quo nunc maxime laboratur in causis omnibus scholisque, cantandi, quod inutilius sit an foedius nescio. Quid enim

<sup>18</sup> Butler: *βρασμον* B    <sup>19</sup> add. Spalding

<sup>36</sup> See Cicero, *De oratore* 1.261 (*uno spiritu*, "with one breath"); Plutarch, *Demosthenes* 11.1–2 (*λόγους ἢ στίχους*, "speeches or lines of verse").    <sup>37</sup> "Shaking" or "shivering."

<sup>38</sup> Such complaints are common: Tacitus, *Dialogus* 26, Seneca, *Suasoriae* 2.10, Seneca, *Epist.* 114.1, Pliny, *Epist.* 2.14.12, 2.16.

natural breaks between phrases. We must however train our breathing to last as long as possible. For this purpose Demosthenes<sup>36</sup> used to recite as many lines as he could without pausing while walking uphill. He also used to roll pebbles under his tongue when practising at home, in order to improve his articulation.

The breath may sometimes be long, full, and clear, but still not held firmly enough, and therefore tremulous—like bodies which look healthy but lack muscle. The Greeks call this *brasmos*.<sup>37</sup> Some people do not so much take in breath as suck it in with a hiss through the gaps in their teeth. There are others whose frequent panting and noisy internal wheezing remind one of overloaded draught animals straining under the load and the yoke. They actually do this deliberately, to suggest that they are overwhelmed by the richness of their Invention and that there is a greater head of eloquence developing within them than can find its way out through the throat. With others, the mouth will not open, and they wrestle with their words. As for coughing and spitting frequently, hawking up phlegm from the bottom of the lungs with a rattle like a windlass, sprinkling everyone around you with the moisture of your mouth, and letting out most of your breath through the nose while you are speaking—these are not of course faults of the voice, but they are *due* to the voice, so that this is perhaps the best place to mention them.

Yet all these faults are tolerable compared with the sing-song manner which is the chief problem in every Cause and every school nowadays<sup>38</sup>—and whether it is more useless than disgusting I do not know! What is less

- minus oratori convenit quam modulatio scaenica et non-  
numquam ebriorum aut comisantium licentiae similis?  
58 Quid vero movendis adfectibus contrarium magis quam,  
cum dolendum irascendum indignandum commiseran-  
dum sit, non solum ab his adfectibus, in quos induendus  
est iudex, recedere, sed ipsam fori sanctitatem ludorum ta-  
larium<sup>20</sup> licentia solvere? Nam Cicero illos ex Lycia<sup>21</sup> et  
59 Caria rhetoras paene cantare in epilogis dixit: nos etiam  
cantandi severiorem paulo modum excessimus. Quis-  
quamne, non dico de homicidio sacrilegio parricidio, sed  
de calculis certe atque rationibus, quisquam denique, ut  
semel finiam, in lite <non><sup>22</sup> cantat? Quod si omnino reci-  
piendum est, nihil causae est cur non illam vocis modula-  
tionem fidibus ac tibiis, immo mehercule, quod est huic  
60 deformitati propius, cymbalis adiuvemus. Facimus tamen  
hoc libenter: nam nec cuiquam sunt iniucunda quae can-  
tant ipsi, et laboris in hoc quam in agendo minus est. Et  
sunt quidam qui secundum alia vitae vitia etiam hac  
ubique audiendi quod aures mulceat voluptate ducantur.  
Quid ergo? non et Cicero dicit esse aliquem in oratione  
'cantum obscuriorem' et hoc quodam naturali initio venit?

<sup>20</sup> Winterbottom: *talarium B*

<sup>21</sup> Phrygia *Cic. Orator 57*

<sup>22</sup> *add. F. Jones, Class. Quart. 38 (1988) 568*

<sup>39</sup> Whether *ludus talarius* is a gambling house (from *talus*, "knucklebone," used as dice; so Dyck on Cicero, *De officiis* 1.50) or a place where long-skirted dancers perform (*talus* = ankle: so *OLD* s.v., and Shackleton Bailey on *Ad Atticum* 1.16.3), it is evidently a noisy place, and that is Q.'s point. Fronto (2.119 Haines = 157 van den Hout<sup>2</sup>) makes it clear that its castanets and cymbals

becoming to an orator than a theatrical recitative which sometimes sounds like the excesses of a drunken orgy or a riotous party? What can be more counterproductive in emotional appeals than if, when what is called for is sorrow, anger, outrage, or pity, the speaker not only distances himself from these emotions (which he should be implanting in the judge's mind), but destroys the very dignity of the court by a sort of naughty song and dance act?<sup>39</sup> Cicero<sup>40</sup> said that those "Lycian and Carian rhetors *almost* sang in their epilogues"—but we have gone beyond the limits of any reasonably restrained style of singing! Does anyone who has to deal—I will not say with homicide or sacrilege or parricide, but with figures and accounts, in a word with any case at law—<not> sing? If this is held to be at all acceptable, there is no reason why we should not accompany the voice with the lyre, the pipes, or indeed—and this would be more suitable for such atrocities—the cymbals?<sup>41</sup> Yet we do it readily enough, because no one dislikes the sound of his own singing, and singing is less hard work than making a proper speech. There are some people, too, who, as well as the other vices of their life, are slaves to the pleasure of listening to sounds that soothe their ears wherever they are. "But does not even Cicero say that there is a sort of 'muffled song' in oratory?<sup>42</sup> And does not this have a

were a public nuisance: a censor closes the places down, because he cannot help dancing to the beat himself as he passes by.

<sup>40</sup> *Orator 57* (but *e Phrygia et Caria*, presumably misremembered by Q.).

<sup>41</sup> Perhaps (see above) with reference to the *ludus talarius*; but cymbals belong also to the eunuch priests of Cybele, and so suggest the *effeminacy* of the oratory which Q. deplores.

<sup>42</sup> *Orator 57*. See below, § 172.



Ostendam non multo post ubi et quatenus recipiendus sit hic flexus et cantus quidem, sed, quod plerique intellegere nolunt, obscurior.

- 61 Iam enim tempus est dicendi quae sit apta pronuntiatio: quae certe ea est quae iis de quibus dicimus accommodatur. Quod quidem maxima ex parte praestant ipsi motus animorum, sonatque vox ut feritur: sed cum sint alii veri adfectus, alii ficti et imitati, veri naturaliter erumpunt, ut dolentium irascentium indignantium, sed carent arte
- 62 ideoque sunt disciplina et ratione formandi. Contra qui effinguntur imitatione, artem habent; sed hi carent natura, ideoque in iis primum est bene adfieri et concipere imagines rerum et tamquam veris moveri. Sic velut media vox, quem habitum a nostris acceperit, hunc iudicum animis dabit: est enim mentis index ac totidem quot illa mutationes habet. Itaque laetis in rebus plena et simplex et ipsa
- 63 quodam modo hilaris fluit; at in certamine erecta totis viribus et velut omnibus nervis intenditur. Atrox in ira et aspera ac densa et respiratione crebra: neque enim potest esse longus spiritus cum immoderate effunditur. Paulum in invidia facienda lentior, quia non fere ad hanc nisi inferiores confugiunt; at in blandiendo fatendo satisfaciendo rogando lenis et summissa. Suadentium et monentium et pollicentium et consolantium gravis: in metu et verecundia contracta, adhortationibus fortis, disputationibus te-

<sup>43</sup> Compare 6.2.25–36.

natural origin?" I shall shortly explain where and to what extent we should accept this variation of pitch, which is indeed a "song," but must be (and this is what most people do not want to understand) "muffled."

(4) It is now time to explain what *appropriate* Delivery is. It is, of course, Delivery adapted to the subject on which we are speaking. This is mainly ensured by our actual feelings; the voice sounds as its strings are struck. But some emotions are real, others pretended or imitated. Real emotions burst out naturally—sorrow, anger, outrage, for example—but they lack art, and have therefore to be disciplined by training and method. Emotions contrived by imitation, on the other hand, involve art, but they have no basis in nature, so that the first thing for us to do is to be genuinely affected, form a picture of the situation, and let ourselves be moved by it as though it was real.<sup>43</sup> The voice, acting as intermediary, will then convey to the judges' minds the attitude it has acquired from ours. It is in fact the indicator of the mind and has all the mind's variations. So, given a happy theme, the voice flows full, unaffected, and with a sort of cheerfulness of its own. In a contentious situation, on the other hand, it is roused in all its strength and strains every nerve. In anger, it is fierce, harsh, and concentrated, with frequent pauses for breath, because the breath cannot be held for long periods when it is expelled with undue violence. In creating animosity, the voice becomes somewhat more hesitant, because only inferiors commonly have recourse to such tactics. In flattery, confession, apology, or request, it is gentle and subdued. Persuasion, warning, promises, and consolations demand a deep voice; fear and shame a restrained one; exhortation needs a strong voice, debate a precise one, compassion one

res, miseratione flexa et flebilis et consulto quasi obscurior;  
 at in egressionibus fusa et securae claritatis, in expositione  
 ac sermonibus recta et inter acutum sonum et gravem  
 65 media. Attollitur autem concitatis adfectibus, compositis  
 descendit, pro utriusque rei modo altius vel inferius.

Quid autem quisque in dicendo postulet locus paulum  
 differam, ut de gestu prius dicam, qui et ipse voci consentit  
 et animo cum ea simul paret. Is quantum habeat in oratore  
 momenti satis vel ex eo patet, quod pleraque etiam citra  
 66 verba significat. Quippe non manus solum sed nutus etiam  
 declarant nostram voluntatem, et in mutis pro sermone  
 sunt, et saltatio frequenter sine voce intellegitur atque  
 adficit, et ex vultu ingressuque perspicitur habitus animo-  
 rum, et animalium quoque sermone carentium ira laetitia  
 adulatio et oculis et quibusdam aliis corporis signis de-  
 67 prenditur. Nec mirum si ista, quae tamen in aliquo posita  
 sunt motu, tantum in animis valent, cum pictura, tacens  
 opus et habitus semper eiusdem, sic in intimos penetret  
 adfectus ut ipsam vim dicendi nonnumquam superare vi-  
 deatur. Contra si gestus ac vultus ab oratione dissentiat,  
 tristia dicamus hilares, adfirmemus aliqua renuentes, non  
 auctoritas modo verbis sed etiam fides desit.

<sup>44</sup> To 11.3.149–184.

that is flexible, tearful, and deliberately half-muffled. In  
 Digressions, the voice spreads itself with confident reso-  
 nance, in Narrative or conversation it is natural and  
 pitched midway between high and low. It is raised when  
 emotions run high, dropped when they are calmer, and  
 pitched higher or lower according to the level of these two  
 kinds of feeling.

### *Gesture*

I postpone for the moment,<sup>44</sup> however, the question of  
 what is required for particular oratorical contexts, in order  
 to speak first of Gesture, which itself conforms to the voice  
 and joins it in obeying the mind. The importance of Ges-  
 ture for an orator is evident from the simple fact that it can  
 often convey meaning even without the help of words. Not  
 only hands but nods show our intentions; for the dumb, in-  
 deed, these take the place of language. A dance too is often  
 understood and emotionally effective without the voice;  
 mental attitudes can be inferred from the face or the walk;  
 and even dumb animals reveal their anger, joy, or wish to  
 please by their eyes or some other bodily signal. Nor is  
 it surprising that these things, which do after all involve  
 some movement, should have such power over the mind,  
 when a picture, a silent work of art in an unvarying atti-  
 tude, can penetrate our innermost feelings to such an ex-  
 tent that it seems sometimes to be more powerful than  
 speech itself. On the other hand, if Gesture and facial ex-  
 pression were out of tune with speech, and we looked  
 cheerful when what we were saying was sad, or shook our  
 heads when asserting something, our words would lack not  
 only authority but credibility.

68 Decor quoque a gestu atque motu venit. Ideoque Demosthenes grande quoddam intuens speculum componere actionem solebat: adeo, quamvis fulgor ille sinistras imagines reddat, suis demum oculis credidit quod efficeret.

Praecipuum vero in actione sicut in corpore ipso caput est, cum ad illum de quo dixi decorem, tum etiam ad significationem. Decoris illa sunt, ut sit primo rectum et secundum naturam: nam et deiecto humilitas et supino adrogantia et in latus inclinato languor et praeduro ac rigente barbaria quaedam mentis ostenditur. Tum accipiat aptos ex ipsa actione motus, ut cum gestu concordet et manibus ac lateribus obsequatur: aspectus enim semper eodem vertitur quo gestus, exceptis quae aut damnare [aut concedere]<sup>23</sup> aut a nobis remove oportebit, ut idem illud vultu videamur aversari, manu repellere:

di talem avertite pestem;

haud equidem tali me dignor honore.

71 Significat vero plurimis modis. Nam praeter adnuendi renuendi confirmandique motus, sunt et verecundiae et dubitationis et admirationis et indignationis noti et communes omnibus. Solo tamen eo facere gestum scaenici

<sup>23</sup> del. Spalding

<sup>45</sup> Plutarch, *Demosthenes* 11.2, Apuleius, *Apologia* 15.

<sup>46</sup> *Aeneid* 3.620 *di talem terris avertite pestem*, 4.265 *di talem avertite casum*.

<sup>47</sup> *Aeneid* 1.335.

Seemliness also comes from Gesture and movement. This is why Demosthenes used to plan his performance in front of a big mirror;<sup>45</sup> despite the fact that the bright surface reverses the image, he had complete trust in his own eyes' ability to tell him what effect he was making.

### *The head*

It is the head which occupies the chief place in Delivery (as it does in the body itself), both as regards the seemliness of which I have just spoken and as regards meaning. (1) For seemliness, it must first be upright and natural. If lowered, it indicates humility; if thrown back, arrogance; if inclined to one side, languor; if held stiff and rigid, a certain brutality of mind. Secondly, it should derive appropriate movements from the pleading itself, keeping time with the Gesture, and following the movement of hands and sides. The eyes of course are *always* turned in the direction of the Gesture, except when we have to reject, [concede,] or distance ourselves from some point: in this case, we seem simultaneously to turn our face away from something and to push it away with our hands:

O gods, avert such plague!<sup>46</sup>

or

I do not think that I deserve such honour.<sup>47</sup>

(2) The head conveys meaning in many different ways. Apart from the movements of assent, denial, and agreement, there are others, well-known and universally used, which express modesty, doubt, surprise, and indignation. However, teachers of acting too think it is wrong to use

quoque doctores vitiosum putaverunt. Etiam frequens eius nutus non caret vitio: adeo iactare id et comas excutientem rotare fanaticum est.

- 72 Dominatur autem maxime vultus. Hoc supplices, hoc minaces, hoc blandi, hoc tristes, hoc hilares, hoc erecti, hoc summissi sumus: <ex><sup>24</sup> hoc pendent homines, hunc intuentur, hic spectatur etiam antequam dicimus: hoc quosdam amamus, hoc odimus, hoc plurima intellegimus, 73 hic est saepe pro omnibus verbis. Itaque in iis quae ad scaenam componuntur fabulis artifices pronuntiandi a personis quoque adfectus mutantur, ut sit Aërope<sup>25</sup> in tragoedia tristis, atrox Medea, attonitus Ajax, truculentus 74 Hercules. In comoediis vero praeter aliam observationem, qua servi lenones parasiti rustici milites meretriculae ancillae, senes austeri ac mites, iuvenes severi ac luxuriosi, matronae puellae inter se discernuntur, pater ille, cuius praecipuae partes sunt, quia interim concitatus interim lenis est, altero erecto altero composito est supercilio, atque id ostendere maxime latus actoribus moris est quod cum iis

<sup>24</sup> add. *Winterbottom*: <ab> *Florilegium Gallicum* (Par. lat. 17903)

<sup>25</sup> *Merope Lange*: Niobe *Petrarch*

<sup>48</sup> I.e. worshippers in ecstatic cults, which involved violent movement and head-tossing. See E. R. Dodds, *The Greeks and the Irrational* 273, for this feature of maenadism; in Latin literature, note Catullus 63.23, Ovid, *Metamorphoses* 3.726, Tacitus, *Annales* 11.31 (Messalina). *Digest* 21.1.8 discusses the question whether a slave who behaves like this can be regarded as *insanus*.

nothing but the head for gesturing. Nodding the head frequently is also a fault: tossing it about and shaking out the hair is for fanatics.<sup>48</sup>

*The face*

But the face is sovereign. It is this that makes us humble, threatening, flattering, sad, cheerful, proud, or submissive; men hang on this; men fix their gaze on this; this is watched even before we start to speak; this makes us love some people and hate others; this makes us understand many things; this often replaces words altogether. Therefore in plays composed for the stage, artists in delivery borrow extra emotion from the masks. Thus in tragedy, Aërope is sad, Medea fierce, Ajax mad, Hercules truculent.<sup>49</sup> In comedy, on the other hand—quite apart from the features regularly used to distinguish slaves, pimps, parasites, farmers, soldiers, prostitutes, maidservants, old men (stern or mild), young men (moral or loose-living), married ladies, and young girls—the father who has the principal role has one eyebrow raised and the other not, because he is sometimes angry and sometimes calm, and the actors regularly turn towards the audience that side of the mask

<sup>49</sup> Aërope is the wife of Atreus, seduced by Thyestes. Merope, daughter of Cypselus, was the subject of a play of Euripides in which she appeared mourning very excessively for the supposed death of her son: there is thus some ground for Lange's emendation, as there is also for Petrarch's Niobe, also famous for her mourning for her children. For such characterizations, see Horace, *Ars Poetica* 122–123 (Medea, Ino, Ixion, Io, Orestes). Ajax' madness is the theme of Sophocles' *Ajax*.

quas agunt partibus congruat.

- 75 Sed in ipso vultu plurimum valent oculi, per quos maxime animus elucet,<sup>26</sup> ut citra motum quoque et hilaritate enitescant et tristitiae quoddam nubilum ducant. Quin etiam lacrimas iis natura mentis indices dedit, quae aut erumpunt dolore aut laetitia manant. Motu vero intenti, remissi, superbi, torvi, mites, asperi fiunt: quae ut actus
- 76 poposcerit finguntur. Rigidi vero et exerti<sup>27</sup> aut languidi et torpentes aut stupentes aut lascivi et mobiles et natantes et quadam voluptate suffusi aut limi et, ut sic dicam, venerii aut poscentes aliquid pollicentesve numquam esse debent. Nam opertos compressosve eos in dicendo quis nisi plane rudis aut stultus habeat?
- 77 Et ad haec omnia exprimenda in palpebris etiam et in
- 78 genis est quoddam deserviens iis ministerium. Multum et superciliis agitur; nam et oculos formant aliquatenus et fronti imperant: his contrahitur attollitur remittitur, ut una res in ea plus valeat, sanguis ille qui mentis habitu movetur, et, cum infirmam verecundia cutem accipit, effunditur in ruborem: cum metu refugit, abit omnis et pallore friges-
- 79 cit: temperatus medium quoddam serenum efficit. Vitium in superciliis si aut inmoti sunt omnino aut nimium mobilia aut inaequalitate, ut modo de persona comica dixeram, dissident aut contra id quod dicimus finguntur: ira enim

<sup>26</sup> D.A.R.: animus emanat b: anima se manat B: animus eminet Spalding <sup>27</sup> Spalding: extenti B

<sup>50</sup> Such masks are seen in reliefs: M. Bieber, *History of the Greek and Roman Theater* (Princeton, 1961) figs. 335-337. Q. may be thinking especially of Demea in Terence's *Adelphoe*,

which suits the particular part they are playing.<sup>50</sup>

In the face itself, the most important feature is the eyes. The mind shines through especially in these. Even unmoved they can sparkle with happiness or be clouded over with grief. Nature has given them tears as well, as an indicator of feelings; and these either burst out in grief or flow for joy. And when the eyes do move, they become intent, relaxed, proud, fierce, gentle, or harsh; these qualities should be assumed as the pleading demands. They must never be fixed, popping out, languishing, sleepy, stupefied, lascivious, shifty, swimming, voluptuous, looking askance, or (if I may say so) sexy, or, finally, asking or promising favours. Of course, no one but a boor or a fool would keep his eyes closed or half-closed as he speaks.

To help them express all these feelings, the eyes have a kind of ancillary service provided by the eyelids and the cheeks. Much also is done by the eyebrows, because these to a certain extent shape the eyes and command the forehead, which they serve to contract, raise, or relax; in fact the only thing which has more influence over it than the brows is the blood which responds to our mental state; this breaks out in blushes when it finds the skin sensitive to shame, disappears altogether in an icy pallor when fear puts it to flight, and maintains a serene equilibrium when in its normal condition. It is a fault in the eyebrows either to be completely immobile or to be too mobile, or again (compare what I said just now about the comic mask)<sup>51</sup> to be at odds with each other, or to be made to contradict what we are saying. They signal anger if they are con-

whose attitudes change radically in the course of the play (855-881). <sup>51</sup> 11.3.74.

contractis, tristitia deductis, hilaritas remissis ostenditur. Adnuendi quoque et renuendi ratione demittuntur aut adlevantur.

- 80 Naribus labrisque non fere quicquam decenter ostendimus, tametsi derisus contemptus fastidium significari solet. Nam et 'corrugare nares,' ut Horatius ait, et inflare et movere et digito inquietare et impulso subito spiritu excutere et diducere saepius et plana manu resupinare indecorum est, cum emunctio etiam frequentior non sine causa reprehendatur.
- 81 Labra et porriguntur male et scinduntur et adstringuntur et diducuntur et dentes nudant et in latus ac paene ad aurem trahuntur et velut quodam fastidio replicantur et pendent et vocem tantum altera parte dimittunt. Lambere quoque ea et mordere deforme est, cum etiam in efficiendis verbis modicus eorum esse debeat motus: ore enim magis quam labris loquendum est.
- 82 Cervicem rectam oportet esse, non rigidam aut supinam. Collum diversa quidem sed pari deformitate et contrahitur et tenditur, sed tenso subest et labor tenuaturque vox ac fatigatur, adfixum pectori mentum minus claram et quasi latiore presso gutture facit.
- 83 Umerorum raro decens adlevatio atque contractio est: breviatur enim cervix et gestum quandam humilem atque

<sup>52</sup> *Epist.* 1.5.23.

tracted, sadness if they are lowered, and happiness if they are relaxed. They are also moved up and down to express agreement or disagreement.

As for the nose and lips, there is hardly anything that we can decently display by their means, though derision, contempt, and disgust are the feelings they usually signify. It is certainly unseemly to "wrinkle the nostrils," as Horace puts it,<sup>52</sup> or to inflate or twitch them, scratch them with the finger, blow through them with a sudden snort, repeatedly open them wide, or push them up with the flat of the hand; even wiping your nose too often is very properly reproved.

As for the lips, pushing them forward, half-opening them, pursing them, opening them wide, baring the teeth, stretching the lips sideways and almost as far as the ear, curling them in scorn, letting them droop, or allowing words to come out of one side of the mouth—all these are bad. Licking or biting them is also an ugly habit, because they ought not to move very much even when forming words. We should speak with the mouth rather than with the lips.

*Neck, shoulders, arms*

The nape of the neck must be straight, not stiff or bent back. As for the front of the neck, contracting it and stretching it are both equally ugly movements, though in different ways; stretching also causes strain, and the voice is weakened and fatigued, while if the chin is pressed on to the chest, it makes the pronunciation less distinct and, as it were, broader, because of the pressure on the throat.

Rarely is it becoming to shrug or hunch the shoulders, because this shortens the neck and produces a Gesture

servilem et quasi fraudulentum facit, quo<sup>28</sup> se in habitum adulationis admirationis metus fingunt.

84 Bracchii moderata proiectio, remissis umeris atque explicantibus se in proferenda manu digitis, continuos et decurrentis locos maxime decet. At cum speciosius quid uberiusque dicendum est, ut illud 'saxa atque solitudines voci respondent,' expatiatur in latus et ipsa quodam modo se cum gestu fundit oratio.

85 Manus vero, sine quibus trunca esset actio ac debilis, vix dici potest quot motus habeant, cum paene ipsam verborum copiam persequantur. Nam ceterae partes loquentem adiuvant, hae, prope est ut dicam, ipsae locuntur. An non his poscimus pollicemur, vocamus dimittimus, minamur supplicamus, abominamur timemus, interrogamus negamus, gaudium tristitiam dubitationem confessionem paenitentiam modum copiam numerum tempus ostendimus? non eaedem concitant inhibent [supplicant]<sup>29</sup> probant admirantur verecundantur? non in demonstrandis locis atque personis adverbiorum atque pronominum optinent vicem?—ut in tanta per omnis gentes nationesque linguae diversitate hic mihi omnium hominum communis sermo videatur.

<sup>28</sup> Spalding: cum B

<sup>29</sup> om. Julius Victor 442, 28 Halm = 98, 25 Giomini—Celentano

<sup>53</sup> See Cicero, *De oratore* 3.220.

<sup>54</sup> "Rocks and deserts respond to the voice": *Pro Archia* 19.

of humiliation and servility, suggesting hypocrisy, because people use it when they are pretending to flatter, admire, or fear.

A moderate extension of the arm,<sup>53</sup> with the shoulders relaxed and the fingers spreading out as the hand is advanced, is a very becoming Gesture for continuous passages that run smoothly. When we have to say something which is particularly impressive and rich—like *saxa atque solitudines voci respondent*<sup>54</sup>—the arm sweeps out to the side and the language somehow expands with the Gesture.

### Hands

As for the hands, without which the Delivery would be crippled and enfeebled, it is almost impossible to say how many movements they possess, for these almost match the entire stock of words. Other parts of the body assist the speaker: the hands, I might almost say, speak for themselves. Do we not use them to demand and promise, summon and dismiss, threaten and beg, show horror and fear, inquire and deny, and also to indicate joy, sadness, doubt, confession, remorse, or again size, quantity, number,<sup>55</sup> and time? Do they not excite, restrain, approve, admire, display shame? Do they not serve instead of adverbs and pronouns when we need to point out places or persons? Amid all the linguistic diversity of the peoples and nations of the world, this, it seems to me, is the common language of the human race.

<sup>55</sup> For the conventional counting gestures see below, § 94 and § 117, and note on 1.10.35.

*Gestures which mimic action*

- 88 Et hi quidem de quibus sum locutus cum ipsis vocibus naturaliter exeunt gestus: alii sunt qui res imitatione significant, ut si aegrum temptantis venas medici similitudine aut citharoedum formatis ad modum percutientis nervos manibus ostendas, quod est genus quam longissime in actione fugiendum. Abesse enim plurimum a saltatore debet orator, ut sit gestus ad sensus magis quam ad verba accommodatus, quod etiam histrionibus paulo gravioribus facere moris fuit. Ergo ut ad se manum referre cum de se ipso loquatur et in eum quem demonstret intendere et aliqua his similia permiserim, ita non effingere status quosdam et quidquid dicet ostendere.
- 89
- 90 Neque id in manibus solum sed in omni gestu ac voce servandum est. Non enim aut in illa perihodo 'stetit soleatus praetor populi Romani' inclinatio incumbens in mulierculam Verris effingenda est, aut in illa 'caedebatur in medio foro Messanae' motus laterum qualis esse ad verbera solet torquendus aut vox qualis dolori exprimitur eruenda, cum mihi comoedi quoque pessime facere videantur quod, etiam si juvenem agant, cum tamen in expositione aut senis sermo, ut in Hydriae prologo, aut mulieris, ut in Georgo, incidit, tremula vel effeminata voce pronuntiant: adeo in illis quoque est aliqua vitiosa imitatio quorum ars omnis constat imitatione.
- 91

<sup>56</sup> I.e. a pantomime performer, whose dancing portrays action.

<sup>57</sup> Cicero, *In Verrem* 5.86. <sup>58</sup> Ibid. 162.

<sup>59</sup> A fragment of this play of Menander (*Hydria*, fr. 401 Koerte) just might be a part of the speech Q. has in mind.

<sup>60</sup> A substantial part of this play of Menander (*Georgos*) survives, including part of the opening monologue (1–88), but there is nothing there to illustrate Q.'s point.

The Gestures of which I have been speaking all appear to be natural concomitants of words. There are others however which express things by mimicry. For example, you can suggest a sick man by imitating a doctor feeling the pulse, or a lyre-player by shaping your hands as if you were striking the strings. You should refrain altogether from such things in pleading. An orator has to be very different from a dancer;<sup>56</sup> he must adapt his Gesture to his sense more than to his words—which indeed was the practice of the more serious actors too. I would readily let him move his hand towards himself when he speaks about himself, or towards a person whom he wishes to point out, and a few things like that; but I do not approve of his miming attitudes and making a visual display of whatever he says.

This caution applies not only to the hands, but to the whole range of Gesture and voice. If you are reading the period "There in his slippers stood the praetor of the Roman people,"<sup>57</sup> you should not mime Verres leaning on his lady-friend; nor, in "He was beaten in the middle of the square at Messana,"<sup>58</sup> should you squirm as though you were being given a flogging, or drag out of yourself the sort of cry that is extorted by pain. It seems to me that comic actors also make a bad mistake when, though playing a young man, they nevertheless have, in a Narrative, to report the words of an old man (as in the prologue of the *The Water Pot*)<sup>59</sup> or a woman (as in the *The Farmer*),<sup>60</sup> and accordingly pronounce these sections in a trembling and womanish voice. Thus one sort of faulty imitation can be found even in those whose whole art consists of imitation!



- 92 Est autem gestus ille maxime communis, quo medius digitus in pollicem contrahitur explicitis tribus, et principiis utilis cum leni in utramque partem motu modice prolatus, simul capite atque umeris sensim ad id quo manus feratur obsecundantibus, et in narrando certus,<sup>30</sup> sed tum paulo productior, et in exprobrando et coarguendo acer atque instans: longius enim partibus iis et liberius exeritur.
- 93 Vitiose vero idem sinistrum quasi umerum petens in latus agi solet, quamquam adhuc peius aliqui transversum brachium proferunt et cubito pronuntiant.
- Duo quoque medii sub pollicem veniunt, et est hic adhuc priore gestus instantior, principio et narrationi non commodatus.
- 94 At cum tres contracti pollice premuntur, tum digitus ille quo usum optime Crassum Cicero dicit explicari solet. Is in exprobrando et indicando (unde ei nomen est) valet, [et]<sup>31</sup> adlevata ac spectante umerum manu paulum inclinat, versus in terram et quasi pronus urget, et aliquando pro numero est.
- 95 Idem summo articulo utrimque leviter adpreso, duobus modice curvatis, minus tamen minimo, aptus ad disputandum est.

<sup>30</sup> gratus M.W., aptus D.A.R. (cf. §95)

<sup>31</sup> del. Becher

<sup>61</sup> *De oratore* 2.188.

<sup>62</sup> I.e. index finger (*indice* . . . *digito*, Horace, *Sermones* 2.8.16).

*Hand Gestures in more detail*

(1) The commonest Gesture consists of bending the middle finger against the thumb and extending the other three. This is useful (a) in the Prooemium, the hand being moved slightly forwards with a gentle movement to either side, and the head and shoulders gradually following the direction of the hand. It is also (b) an assured Gesture in the Narrative, but then it should extend somewhat further forward, and (c) a Gesture of energy and insistence in reproaches and refutations, because here the hand is extended further and more freely. On the other hand, it is wrong for this movement to be directed (as it often is) sideways, as though aiming at the left shoulder; even worse, some people hold the arm out across the body and make their statement with their elbow.

(2) The two middle fingers can also be turned under the thumb; this is an even more insistent Gesture than the last, and is not suitable for Prooemium or Narrative.

(3) When three fingers are doubled under the thumb, the finger which Cicero<sup>61</sup> says Crassus used so well is extended. This finger is important in reproach and in pointing things out (which is why it has its name).<sup>62</sup> Turned slightly downwards, with the whole hand raised and turned towards the shoulder, it expresses strong statement; pointed down towards the ground, facing downwards, as it were, it insists on a point. Sometimes also it indicates number.

(4) Again, if the top joint of this finger is gripped lightly on both sides, and the two last fingers are slightly curved (the little finger rather less so), the Gesture is appropriate in arguing a point.

Acrius tamen argumentari videntur qui medium articulum potius tenent, tanto contractionibus ultimis digitis quanto priores descenderunt.

96 Est et ille verecundae orationi aptissimus, quo, quatuor primis leviter in summum coeuntibus digitis, non procul ab ore aut pectore fertur ad nos manus et deinde prona  
97 ac paulum prolata laxatur. Hoc modo coepisse Demosthenen credo in illo pro Ctesiphonte timido summissoque principio, sic formatam Ciceronis manum cum diceret: 'si, iudices, ingeni mei, quod sentio quam sit exiguum.'

Eadem aliquatenus liberior deorsum spectantibus digitis colligitur in nos et fusius paulo in diversum resolvitur, ut quodam modo sermonem ipsum proferre videatur.

98 Binos interim digitos distinguimus, sed non inserto pollice, paulum tamen inferioribus intra spectantibus, sed ne illis quidem tensis qui supra sunt.

99 Interim extremi palmas circa ima pollicis premunt, ipse prioribus ad medios articulos iungitur, interim quartus oblique reponitur, interim quattuor remissis magis quam tensis, pollice intus inclinato, habilem demonstrando in latus aut distinguendis quae dicimus manum

<sup>63</sup> *On the Crown* 3-4.

<sup>64</sup> *Pro Archia* 1.

(5) Those who prefer to hold the middle joint, and contract the two last fingers more, to match the lower position of the thumb and the middle finger, give the impression of a sharper level of debate.

(6) A Gesture particularly well adapted to an expression of modesty consists in bringing the thumb and the first three fingers gently together to a point, and moving the hand towards the body in the region of the mouth or chest, then letting it fall, palm downwards and slightly brought forward. This, I fancy, was the Gesture with which Demosthenes began the timid and subdued Prooemium of his defence of Ctesiphon;<sup>63</sup> this is surely how Cicero held his hand when he said "If, members of the jury, there is any talent in me—and I know how little it is."<sup>64</sup>

(7) The hand may also be drawn towards the body, with the fingers pointing down a little more freely, and then opened more widely to face the opposite way, so that it seems to be somehow delivering our actual words.

(8) Sometimes, we separate the first two fingers from the others, not however inserting the thumb between them, but with the fourth and little fingers turned slightly inwards, and the other two also not fully extended.

(9) Sometimes again the two last fingers press on the palm around the base of the thumb, while the thumb itself is pressed against the middle joints of the two first fingers.

(10) Sometimes the fourth finger is bent back to the side.

(11) Sometimes, by relaxing rather than extending all four fingers, and letting the thumb incline inwards, we produce a hand which is useful for pointing to one side or marking breaks in what we are saying; the hand moves

facimus, cum supina in sinistrum latus, prona in alterum fertur.

100 Sunt et illi breves gestus, cum manus leviter pandata, qualis faventium<sup>32</sup> est, parvis intervallis et subadsentientibus umeris movetur, maxime apta parce et quasi timide loquentibus.

Est admirationi conveniens ille gestus, quo manus modice supinata ac per singulos a minimo collecta digitos redeunte flexu simul explicatur atque convertitur.

101 Nec uno modo interrogantes gestum componimus, plerumque tamen vertentes manum, utcumque composita est.

Pollici proximus digitus medium qua dexter est unguem pollicis summo suo iungens, remissis ceteris, est et adprobatibus et narrantibus et distinguentibus decorus.

102 Cui non dissimilis, sed complicitis tribus digitis, quo nunc Graeci plurimum utuntur, etiam utraque manu, quotiens enthymemata sua gestu corrutundant velut caesim.

Manus lentior promittit et adsentatur, citatior hortatur, interim laudat.

Est et ille urgentis orationem gestus, vulgaris magis

<sup>32</sup> *recc.*: fovementum B: voventium *edd.* ('making a vow'): fomentium b

<sup>65</sup> Or "at short intervals." Obscure: the commonly accepted emendation *voventium*, "of persons making a vow," is unlikely because the normal gesture for this would be to raise the arms towards heaven. <sup>66</sup> I.e. middle, fourth, and little fingers.

<sup>67</sup> I.e. *κατὰ κόμματα*. Compare Juvenal 6.449, who cautions against having a wife who "hurls a curving Enthymeme in spinning sentence."

palm-upwards towards the left, palm-down towards the right.

There are other small Gestures too.

(12) Hand slightly curved (as though expressing support), and moved short distances<sup>65</sup> to the accompaniment of a small shoulder movement, is a Gesture which is particularly appropriate for the restrained speaker who wishes to give an impression of timidity.

(13) Surprise is well suited by the Gesture in which the hand is turned slightly upwards, closed by bringing the fingers in to it, one by one, starting with the little finger, and then opened again all at once with a reverse movement, and finally turned over.

(14) For asking questions, there is more than one Gesture available, but the common one is to turn the hand towards the person being questioned; the fingers may be positioned in any way you choose.

(15) If the first finger touches the middle of the right-hand edge of the thumbnail with its tip, the other fingers being relaxed, we have a Gesture wholly appropriate to approval or narrative or marking a distinction.

(16) Not dissimilar, but with the three fingers<sup>66</sup> bent, is something which the Greeks employ a great deal nowadays, even using both hands, when they shape their rounded Enthymemes with a Gesture, marking every phrase.<sup>67</sup>

(17) A slower hand movement expresses promise or agreement, a quicker one is for exhortation or sometimes for praise.

(18) There is also a Gesture of insistence, which belongs to everyday use rather than to art, consisting in alter-

quam ex arte, qui contrahit alterno celerique motu et explicat manum.

- 103 Est et illa cava et rara et supra umeri altitudinem elata cum quodam motu velut hortatrix manus; a peregrinis scholis tamen prope recepta tremula scaenica est.

Digitos cum summi coierunt ad os referre cur quibusdam displicuerit nescio: nam id et leviter<sup>33</sup> admirantes et interim subita indignatione <et><sup>34</sup> velut pavescentes et deprecantes facimus.

- 104 Quin compressam etiam manum in paenitentia vel ira pectori admovemus, ubi vox vel inter dentes expressa non dedecet: 'Quid nunc agam?' 'Quid facias?'

Averso pollice demonstrare aliquid receptum magis puto quam oratori decorum.

- 105 Sed cum omnis motus sex partes habeat, septimus sit ille qui in se redit orbis, vitiosa est una circumversio: reliqui ante et pone<sup>35</sup> et dextra laevaue et sursum et deorsum aliquid ostendunt. (In posteriora gestus non derigitur: interim tamen velut reici solet.)

- 106 Optime autem manus a sinistra parte incipit, in dextra deponitur, sed ut ponere, non ut ferire videatur: quam-

<sup>33</sup> K: leniter B: lenites b

<sup>34</sup> add. Winterbottom

<sup>35</sup> et pone D.A.R.: nos B

<sup>68</sup> Others punctuate strongly after *recepta*, not after *manus*: "a hand for encouragement, as it were, an import from foreign schools, but almost accepted. As for the hand that trembles, that belongs on the stage."

<sup>69</sup> For those "six" movements see Cicero, *Timaeus* 48, which has *ante et pone* (for Plato's (43B) εἰς τὸ πρόσθε καὶ ὀπίσθην). If I am right to read *et pone* in Q. also, he explains in the following

nately closing and opening the hand with a rapid movement.

(19) There is also the cupped hand, with fingers widely spread, raised above shoulder level, waved around a little, and meant to convey encouragement.

(20) The trembling hand, an import from foreign schools, but now almost accepted, really belongs on the stage.<sup>68</sup>

(21) I am not sure why some people have disapproved of raising the fingers, with the tips brought together, towards the mouth. In fact we do this (a) when we are slightly surprised, (b) sometimes in a sudden burst of indignation, (c) when we pretend to be frightened or to be making an entreaty.

(22) We can also clench the hand and draw it close to the chest in remorse or anger: in these circumstances there is nothing wrong in an exclamation forced out between the teeth: "What am I to do now?" "What would you do?"

(23) Pointing out something with the thumb turned back I regard as accepted rather than really appropriate for an orator.

Of the six kinds of motion,<sup>69</sup> to which circular movement may be added as a seventh, it is *only* this circular form which is bad, while the others—forward <and backward>, right and left, up and down—all have a significance. (Gesture is never *directed* to the back of the speaker, but it is sometimes, as it were, thrown backwards.)

It is best for the hand to begin its movement on the left and end it on the right, but in such a way that it seems to be

sentence the very limited sense in which a gesture can be said to turn "backwards."

quam et in fine<sup>36</sup> interim cadit, ut cito tamen redeat, et nonnumquam resilit vel negantibus nobis vel admirantibus.<sup>37</sup>

- Hic veteres artifices illud recte adiecerunt, ut manus cum sensu et inciperet et deponeretur: alioqui enim aut ante vocem erit gestus aut post vocem, quod est utrumque deforme. In illo lapsi nimia subtilitate sunt, quod interval-  
 107 lum motus tria verba esse voluerunt, quod neque observatur nec fieri potest; sed illi quasi mensuram tarditatis celeritatisque aliquam esse voluerunt—neque inmerito—ne aut diu otiosa esset manus aut, quod multi faciunt, actionem continuo motu concideret.
- 108 Aliud est quod et fit frequentius et magis fallit. Sunt quaedam latentes sermonis percussiones et quasi aliqui pedes ad quos plurimorum gestus cadit, ut sit unus motus 'novum crimen,' alter 'C. Caesar,' tertius 'et ante hanc diem,' quartus 'non auditum,' deinde 'propinquus meus' et  
 109 'ad te' et 'Q. Tubero' et 'detulit.' Unde id quoque fluit vitium, ut iuvenes cum scribunt, gestu praemodulati cogitationem, sic componant quo modo casura manus est. Inde et illud vitium, ut gestus, qui in fine dexter esse debet, in si-  
 110 nistrum frequenter desinat. Melius illud, cum sint in sermone omni brevia quaedam membra ad quae, si necesse sit, recipere spiritum liceat, ad haec gestum disponere. Ut

<sup>36</sup> in fine del. Winterbottom      <sup>37</sup> adfirmantibus Winterbottom ('when we affirm'): admirantibus B

<sup>70</sup> Pro Ligario 1.

<sup>71</sup> Compare Aristotle's account of the dramatic poet composing: τοῖς σχήμασι συνεργαζόμενον, "working out (his plot) with gestures," *Poetics* 1455a29.

putting something down gently, not striking a blow. Sometimes however it is lowered at the end, but only to go back quickly; and sometimes it springs back, to express either denial or surprise.

The old experts on this subject rightly added at this point that the hand movement should begin and end with the sense, for otherwise the Gesture will either anticipate the voice or lag behind it, and in either case the result is unsightly. But their excessive subtlety led them into the mistake of recommending an interval of three words between movements; this is not observed, and is impracticable. The fact is that they wanted (very properly) to have some sort of measure of slowness and speed, so that the hand should not rest idle for long or fragment the delivery by continual movement, as is the practice of many speakers.

There is another mistake too, both commoner and easier to overlook. Language possesses certain hidden stresses, one might say metrical feet, and the Gestures of many speakers coincide with these: e.g. *novum crimen* ("new charge")—one movement; *Gai Caesar*, a second; *et ante hanc diem* ("previous to this day"), a third; *non auditum* ("unheard of"), a fourth; then *propinquus meus* ("my relation"), then *ad te* ("before you"), then *Quintus Tubero*, then *detulit* ("brought").<sup>70</sup> From this flows another fault: when students are writing something and articulating their thoughts by rehearsing the Gestures, they tend to compose their sentences to fit the way in which the hand is to fall.<sup>71</sup> This gives rise to yet another mistake: the Gesture, which ought to end on the right, often ends on the left. It is better therefore, in view of the fact that there are short units in all speech, where we can draw breath if we need to, to arrange the Gesture to fit these. For instance, *novum*

puta: 'novum crimen C. Caesar' habet per se finem quen-  
dam suum, quia sequitur coniunctio: deinde 'et ante hanc  
diem non auditum' satis circumscriptum est: ad haec com-  
modanda manus est. Idque dum erit prima et composita  
111 actio: at ubi eam calor concitaverit, etiam gestus cum ipsa  
orationis celeritate crebrescet.

Aliis locis citata, aliis pressa conveniet pronuntiatio: illa  
transcurrimus congerimus festinamus, hac instamus incul-  
camus infigimus. Plus autem adfectus habent lentiora,  
ideoque Roscius citatior, Aesopus gravior fuit quod ille  
112 comoedias, hic tragoedias egit. Eadem motus quoque ob-  
servatio est. Itaque in fabulis iuvenum senum militum  
matronarum gravior incessus<sup>38</sup> est, servi ancillulae para-  
siti piscatores citatius moventur.

Tolli autem manum artifices supra oculos, demitti infra  
pectus vetant: adeo a capite eam petere aut ad imum ven-  
113 trem deducere vitiosum habetur. In sinistrum intra ume-  
rum promovetur, ultra non decet. Sed cum aversantes in  
laevam partem velut propellemus manum, sinister umerus  
proferendus, ut cum capite ad dextram ferente<sup>39</sup> consen-  
tiat.

114 Manus sinistra numquam sola gestum recte facit: dex-  
trae se frequenter accommodat, sive in digitos argumenta  
digerimus sive aversis in sinistrum palmis abominamur

<sup>38</sup> *Winterbottom*: ingessus b: ingressus B

<sup>39</sup> *vergente Watt* 1982

<sup>72</sup> Roscius did also act in tragedy (Cicero, *De oratore* 3.102).  
He and his contemporary Aesopus were the most famous of all  
Roman actors. <sup>73</sup> Compare Plautus, *Poenulus* 522–525 (and  
the whole scene); *Rudens* 290–305 (fishermen).

*crimen*, *Gai Caesar* has a sort of end of its own, because  
a conjunction follows; and then *et ante hanc diem non*  
*auditum* is clearly marked off. It is to *these* divisions that  
the hand movements should be adapted. This applies to  
the earlier and calmer part of a speech; when the tempera-  
ture goes up, Gesture too will become more frequent as  
the Delivery becomes faster.

Some passages are better suited by a quick Delivery,  
some by a restrained one. We use the former to pass rap-  
idly over things, to pile up details, and to hurry on; the lat-  
ter to insist, to emphasize, and to drive points home. A  
slower Delivery is more emotive; hence Roscius, because  
he acted in comedy, was quicker, and Aesopus the tragic  
actor more sedate.<sup>72</sup> The same applies also to movements.  
In plays, young men, old men, soldiers, and married ladies  
advance sedately; slaves, slave girls, parasites, and fisher-  
men move with more speed.<sup>73</sup>

The experts also tell us never to raise our hand above  
eye-level, or lower it below the chest; so it is indeed wrong  
to have to pull your hand down from above your head, or to  
lower it to the bottom of your belly! It may be moved to the  
left as far as the shoulder; anything beyond that is un-  
seemly. But when we thrust the hand out to the left to show  
aversion to something, the left shoulder should be brought  
forward, so as to coincide with a movement of the head  
towards the right.

The left hand never rightly makes a Gesture on its  
own,<sup>74</sup> but it often lends support to the right, if we are  
either (1) telling off arguments on our fingers, or (2) turn-

<sup>74</sup> The left hand was barely available for gesture, so long as it  
had to hold up the fold of the toga (11.3.141).

- sive obicimus adversis<sup>40</sup> sive in latus utramque disten-  
 115 dimus sive satisficientes aut supplicantes (diversi autem  
 sunt hi gestus) summittimus sive adorantes attollimus sive  
 aliqua demonstratione aut invocatione protendimus: 'vos  
 Albani tumuli atque luci,' aut Gracchanum illud: 'Quo me  
 miser conferam? In Capitolium? At fratris sanguine ma-  
 116 det.<sup>41</sup> An domum?' Plus enim adfectus in his iunctae ex-  
 hibent manus, in rebus parvis mitibus tristibus breves,  
 magnis laetis atrocibus exertiores.  
 117 Vitia quoque earum subicienda sunt, quae quidem  
 accidere etiam exercitatis actoribus solent. Nam gestum  
 poculum poscentis aut verbera minantis aut numerum  
 quingentorum flexo pollice efficientis, quae sunt a quibus-  
 118 dam scriptoribus notata, ne in rusticis quidem vidi. At ut  
 brachio exerto introspectatur latus, ut manum alius ultra  
 sinum proferre non audeat, alius in quantum patet longi-  
 tudo protendat, aut ad tectum erigat, aut repetito ultra  
 laevum umerum gestu ita in tergum flagellet ut consistere  
 post eum parum tutum sit, aut sinistrum ducat orbem, aut  
 temere sparsa manu in proximos offendat, aut cubitum

<sup>40</sup> D.A.R.: adversas B      <sup>41</sup> At fratris sanguine madet *recc.*,  
 from Cic. *De oratore* 3.214: ad fratris sanguinem B

<sup>75</sup> Cicero, *Pro Milone* 85.      <sup>76</sup> From C. Gracchus' speech  
 in the last days of his life (121 BC), quoted by Cicero, *De oratore*  
 3.214: ORF p. 196.      <sup>77</sup> I.e. presumably by forming it into the  
 shape Γ, the Greek numeral for 5. The right thumb so bent signi-  
 fied 500. See above, § 86.

<sup>78</sup> Compare *Letter Journal of George Canning 1793–1795* (ed.  
 P. Jupp, Camden Society, 1991), 60 (House of Commons, 31 Jan.  
 1794): "People about me are apprehensive of some mischief from

ing our palms away to the left to express horror, or (3) mak-  
 ing an objection by thrusting them forward, or (4) stretch-  
 ing both hands out sideways, or (5) lowering them in  
 apology or supplication (but note that these are distinct  
 Gestures), or finally (6) raising them in prayer or stretch-  
 ing them out to point to something or in an invocation: "Ye  
 hills and groves of Alba"<sup>75</sup> or Gracchus' "Where shall I turn  
 in my misery? To the Capitol? <It is soaked in> my  
 brother's blood. To my house?"<sup>76</sup> and so on. The use of the  
 two hands together produces more emotion in such pas-  
 sages; when the subject is unimportant, unthreatening, or  
 sad, they are held close to the body; with grander themes,  
 or when joy or outrage is called for, they are thrust further  
 forward.

I must mention here faults of hand gestures into which  
 even experienced pleaders often fall. The Gesture of de-  
 manding a cup, threatening a flogging, or indicating the  
 number 500 by crooking the thumb,<sup>77</sup> all of which are  
 mentioned by some writers, I have never seen, even in un-  
 educated speakers. But I know some things that do often  
 happen: an arm is exposed and we catch a glimpse of the  
 speaker's side; a man dares not stick his hand out beyond  
 the fold of his toga; another stretches his arm out to its full  
 length, raises it towards the roof, or swings it back and  
 forth over his left shoulder, raining down blows to the rear,  
 so that it is dangerous to be standing behind him;<sup>78</sup> another  
 makes a leftwards sweep, waves his hand around at ran-  
 dom and hits his neighbours, or else flaps both elbows

me. Lord Bayham I did once hit a plaguy hard blow on the shoul-  
 der—Pitt . . . sidled a little out of the way, and Dundas was obliged  
 to bob to save his wig from confusion."

119 utrumque in diversum latus ventilet, saepe scio evenire. Solet esse et pigra et trepida et secanti similis tinterim etiam uncis digitis aut a capite deiciatur aut eadem manu supinata in superiora iactetur.<sup>42</sup>

Fit et ille <gestus><sup>43</sup> qui, inclinato in umerum dextrum capite, brachio ab aure protenso, manum infesto pollice extendit: qui quidem maxime placet iis qui se dicere sublata manu iactant. Adicias licet eos qui sententias vibrantis digitis iaculantur aut manu sublata denuntiant aut, quod

120 per se interim recipiendum est, quotiens aliquid ipsis placuit in unguis eriguntur, sed vitiosum id faciunt aut digito quantum plurimum possunt erecto aut etiam duobus, aut utraque manu ad modum aliquid portantium composita.

121 His accedunt vitia non naturae sed trepidationis: cum ore concurrente rixari; si memoria fefellerit aut cogitatio non suffragetur, quasi faucibus aliquid obstiterit insonare; in adversum tergere nares, obambulare sermone imperfecto, resistere subito et laudem silentio poscere. Quae omnia persequi prope infinitum est: sua enim cuique sunt vitia.

122 Pectus ac venter ne proiciantur observandum: pandant enim posteriora et est odiosa omnis supinitas.

<sup>42</sup> I translate interim etiam <ut aut (Halm)> uncis digitis [aut] a capite deiciatur aut [eadem manu del. M.W. after Buttmann] supinata in superiora iactetur <sup>43</sup> ille <gestus> Halm: ille habitus qui esse in statuis pacificator solet ille b ('the attitude which is commonly a peacemaking one in statues')

<sup>79</sup> Very uncertain: see text note. <sup>80</sup> Infesto pollice suggests the "thumbs down" given to the doomed gladiator; but here it is part of a neutral gesture, as in Apuleius, *Metamorphoses* 2.21 (Thelyphron's oratorical technique here should be studied in the light of Q.'s precepts). <sup>81</sup> See 2.12.9.

against his two sides. And then there is the sluggish or timid hand, and the hand that moves as though it were slicing something, or that sometimes either swoops down from head level with the fingers hooked, or shoots upwards with the palm uppermost.<sup>79</sup>

Another <Gesture> consists in inclining the head towards the right shoulder, stretching out the arm level with the ear, and extending the hand with the thumb down;<sup>80</sup> this is particularly in favour with people who like to boast of speaking "with hand raised."<sup>81</sup> We may add those who brandish their flashing phrases on their fingers, or utter denunciations "with hand raised," or (and this is sometimes acceptable in principle) rise on tiptoe whenever they have said something they are pleased with. This however becomes a fault if they raise one, or even two, fingers, as high as they can, or bring both hands together like people carrying something.

There are also faults not of nature but of nervousness: struggling with a mouth that refuses to open; making a rumbling noise, as if something is stuck in your throat, if your memory has failed or your thoughts will not come to mind; wiping your nose without turning aside to do so; walking up and down in mid-sentence; stopping suddenly and pausing for applause. It would be an endless task to list all these things. Every individual has his own faults.

### *Gestures of the body*

Take care not to thrust the chest or stomach forward. This arches the back, and all bending backwards is unsightly.



- Latera cum gestu consentiant: facit enim aliquid et totius corporis motus, adeo ut Cicero plus illo agi quam manibus ipsis putet. Ita enim dicit in *Oratore*: 'nullae argutiae digitorum, non ad numerum articulus cadens, trunco magis toto se ipse moderans et virili laterum flexione.'
- 123 Femur ferire, quod Athenis primus fecisse creditur Cleon, et usitatum est et indignantes decet et excitat auditorem. Idque in Calidio Cicero desiderat: 'non frons' inquit 'per-  
cussa, non femur.' Quamquam, si licet, de fronte dissentio: nam etiam complodere manus scaenicum est [pectus cae-  
124 dere].<sup>44</sup> Illud quoque raro decebit, cava manu summis digitis pectus adpetere si quando nosmet ipsos adloquemur cohortantes obiurgantes miserantes: quod si quando fiet, togam quoque inde removeri non dedecabit.
- In pedibus observantur status et incessus. Prolato dextro stare et eandem manum ac pedem proferre deforme est. In dextrum incumbere interim datur, sed aequo pectore, qui tamen comicus magis quam oratorius gestus est. Male etiam in sinistram pedem insistentium dexter aut tollitur aut summis digitis suspenditur. Varicare supra mo-

<sup>44</sup> *del. Winterbottom*

<sup>82</sup> 59.

<sup>83</sup> Plutarch, *Nicias* 8 says that Cleon was the first to "shout in a public speech, pull his clothes apart, strike his thigh, and run around while he was speaking." On his oratory see also Thucydides 3.36, Cicero, *Brutus* 28.

<sup>84</sup> *Brutus* 278: see 10.1.23.

<sup>85</sup> For the importance of the manner of walking, see Bremmer and Roodenburg (1991) 16–23, Gleason (1994) 60–63. Aristotle's

The side must be in tune with the Gesture, for the movement of the whole body is important, so much so that Cicero says that more is done by this than by the hands themselves. This is what he says in the *Orator*:<sup>82</sup> "No twiddling of the fingers, no marking the rhythm with the finger joint; he controls himself more by the pose of his whole body and the manly flexing of the side." Slapping the thigh, which Cleon<sup>83</sup> is supposed to have been the first to do at Athens, is common practice; it is quite proper for an indignant speaker, and it stimulates the audience. Cicero<sup>84</sup> notes the lack of it in Calidius: "no striking of the forehead or the thigh." With regard to the forehead, I beg to differ; for even to clap your hands [beat your breast] is theatrical. Only rarely will it be proper to touch the breast with the tips of the fingers, hand hollowed, when for example we exhort, reproach, or commiserate with ourselves. In these circumstances, it will not be improper either to draw the toga back from the chest.

*Feet*

As to the feet, both stance and walk require attention.<sup>85</sup> It is unsightly to stand with the right foot in front, and to put the same hand and foot forward together. It may be sometimes acceptable to put the weight on the right foot, but only if you hold your chest level; even so, this is a Gesture of comedy rather than of oratory. Again, when you put your weight on the left foot, it is bad to raise the right, or keep it poised on tiptoe. Holding the feet too far apart is

"high-minded man" (*μεγαλόψυχος*) sets the pattern: slow movements, deep voice, sedate speech (*Nicomachean Ethics* 1125a34).

- dum et in stando deforme est et accedente motu prope obscenum. Procuratio oportuna brevis moderata [rara]<sup>45</sup> conveniet: iam et ambulatio quaedam propter inmodicas laudationum moras, quamquam Cicero rarum incessum neque ita longum probat. Discursare vero et, quod Domitius Afer de Sura Manlio dixit, 'satagere' ineptissimum: urbaneque Flavus Verginius interrogavit de quodam suo antisophiste quot milia passum declamasset. Praecipi et illud scio, ne ambulantes avertamur a iudicibus, sed sint obliqui pedes ad consilium nobis respicientibus. Id fieri iudicii privatis non potest, verum et breviora sunt spatia nec aversi diu sumus. Interim tamen recedere sensim datur. Quidam et resiliunt, quod est plane ridiculum. Pedis suppletio ut loco est oportuna, ut ait Cicero, in contentionibus aut incipiendis aut finiendis, ita crebra et inepti est hominis et desinit iudicem in se convertere. Est et illa indecora in dextrum ac laevum latus vacillatio alternis pedibus insistentium. Longissime fugienda mollis actio, qualem in Titio Cicero dicit fuisse, unde etiam saltationis quoddam genus Titius sit appellatum. Reprehendenda et illa frequens et concitata in utramque partem nutatio, quam in Curione patre inrisit et Iulius, quaerens quis in luntre loqueretur, et Sicinius: nam cum adsidente collega, qui erat propter vale-

<sup>45</sup> del. M.W.

<sup>86</sup> *Orator* 59. <sup>87</sup> See 6.3.54. <sup>88</sup> See on 3.1.21. Q. here implies that Verginius also counted as a *sophistes*, i.e. a declaimer and teacher of rhetoric. <sup>89</sup> I.e. where there is a single judge, and cases may even be heard in a private house.

<sup>90</sup> *De oratore* 3.220.

<sup>91</sup> Cicero, *Brutus* 225.

<sup>92</sup> All this is from *Brutus* 216–217. The elder C. Scribonius

unsightly if you are standing still, and almost indecent if combined with movement. A step forward is quite in order, so long as it is opportune, short, and well controlled. So is a certain amount of walking up and down if there are unreasonable delays occasioned by applause, though Cicero<sup>86</sup> approves of walking about only on rare occasions and not for long. As for running up and down, and what Domitius Afer called Manlius Sura's "over-acting,"<sup>87</sup> it is totally foolish. Verginius Flavus<sup>88</sup> wittily asked a rival sophist "how many miles he had declaimed." I know we are also advised not to turn our backs on the judges as we walk, but to move at an angle and keep our eyes on the panel. This is impossible in private trials,<sup>89</sup> but the distances are less there, and we do not have to turn our backs for long. Sometimes however it is permissible to step back gradually. Some people *jump* back: this is simply ridiculous. Stamping the foot can be opportune on occasion, as Cicero says,<sup>90</sup> at the beginning or end of a passage of aggressive argument, but if it is done often it shows the speaker to be a fool, and ceases to attract the judge's attention. Swaying to right and left and shifting the weight from one foot to another is another indecorous performance. Above all, one should avoid effeminate movements, such as Cicero ascribes to Titius<sup>91</sup>—which is how a type of dance came to be called a Titius. Another reprehensible practice is that of rapidly and frequently rocking to and fro; the elder Curio<sup>92</sup> was ridiculed for this, both by Julius, who asked "who was that man talking on a boat?" and by Sicinius; for, when Curio had been

Curio, consul 76 BC, was an opponent of Cicero; C. Julius Caesar Strabo, aedile 90 BC, was killed by Marius' supporters in 87 BC; Cn. Sicinius was *tribunus plebis* in 76 BC.

tudinem et deligatus et plurimis medicamentis delibutus, multum se Curio ex more iactasset, 'numquam,' inquit, 'Octavi, collegae tuo gratiam referes, qui nisi fuisset, hodie te istic muscae comedissent.'

130 Iactantur et umeri, quod vitium Demosthenes ita dicitur emendasse ut, cum in angusto quodam pulpito stans diceret, hasta umero dependens immineret, ut, si calore dicendi vitare id excidisset, offensatione illa commoneretur. Ambulantem loqui ita demum oportet si in causis publicis, in quibus multi sunt iudices, quod dicimus quasi  
131 singulis inculcare peculiariter velimus. Illud non ferendum, quod quidam reiecta in umerum toga, cum dextra sinum usque lumbos reduxerunt, sinistra gestum facientes spatiantur et fabulantur, cum etiam laevam restringere prolata longius dextra sit odiosum. Unde moneor ut ne id quidem transeam, ineptissime fieri cum inter moras laudationum aut in aurem alicuius locuntur aut cum sodalibus iocantur aut nonnumquam ad librarios suos ita respiciunt ut sportulam dictare videantur.

132 Inclinari ad iudicem cum doceas, utique si id de quo loquaris sit obscurius, decet. Incumbere advocato adversis subselliis sedenti iam contumeliosum. Reclinari etiam ad suos et manibus sustineri, nisi plane iusta fatigatio est, delicatum: sicut palam moneri excidentis aut legere: namque  
133

<sup>93</sup> See [Plutarch], *Lives of the Ten Orators* 844E.

<sup>94</sup> Slaves would be carrying books or making notes for the advocate; the suggestion is that money is also offered to an applauding audience (see Pliny, *Epist.* 2.14.4 on hired audiences in the courts: "Presents are offered in the basilica as openly as at dinner parties; they move from one trial to the next for the same reward").

throwing himself about in his usual style while his colleague Octavius sat beside him, bandaged and smothered in medicaments because of his illness, Sicinius said "Octavius, you can never be thankful enough to your colleague; if *he* hadn't been here, the flies would have eaten you today."

Moving the shoulders about is another fault. Demosthenes<sup>93</sup> is said to have cured himself of this by standing to speak on a narrow platform, with a spear suspended above his shoulder, so that if in the heat of his speech he forgot to avoid this, he would be warned by a prick from the spear. Walking about while speaking is only justified if, in public Causes, in which there are many judges, we want to impress our arguments specially on certain individuals. Some speakers throw the toga back over the shoulder, having drawn the fold of it down to the hips with the right hand, and then walk about and chatter while gesturing with the left hand: this is intolerable. It is objectionable even to draw your left hand in when you reach out further with your right. And this reminds me not to forget to mention how very foolish it is, in the intervals for applause, to whisper into someone's ear or joke with friends or turn to your clerks from time to time, so as to look as if you were giving instructions for a gratuity to be handed out.<sup>94</sup>

It is quite proper to lean towards the judge when giving him the facts of the case, especially if what you are saying is in any way obscure. On the other hand, to lean over the advocate sitting on the opposite bench is insulting. Leaning back towards your friends and letting them support you in their arms is an affectation, unless you have good reason to be tired. The same goes for being openly prompted when something slips your mind, and for reading from a text. All

in his omnibus et vis illa dicendi solvitur et frigescit adfectus et iudex parum sibi praestari reverentiae credit. Transire in diversa subsellia parum verecundum est: nam et Cassius Severus urbane adversus hoc facientem lineas poposcit, et si aliquando concitate itur, numquam non frigide reditur.

- 134 Multum ex iis quae praecepimus mutari necesse est ab iis qui dicunt apud tribunalia: nam et vultus erectior, ut eum apud quem dicitur spectet, et gestus ut ad eundem tendens elatior sit necesse est, et alia quae occurrere etiam me tacente omnibus possunt. Itemque ab iis qui sedentes agent: nam et fere fit hoc in rebus minoribus, et idem impetus actionis esse non possunt,<sup>46</sup> et quaedam vitia fiunt necessaria. Nam et dexter pes a laeva iudicis sedenti proferendus est, et ex altera parte multi gestus necesse est in sinistrum eant, ut ad iudicem spectent. Equidem plerisque et ad singulas clausulas sententiarum video adsurgentis et nonnullos subinde aliquid etiam spatiantis, quod an deceat ipsi viderint: cum id faciunt, non sedentes agunt.
- 136 Bibere aut etiam esse inter agendum, quod multis moris fuit et est quibusdam, ab oratore meo procul absit. Nam si quis aliter dicendi onera perferre non possit, non ita

<sup>46</sup> possit *Winterbottom*

<sup>95</sup> See on 10.1.116.

<sup>96</sup> Like the ropes which separated seats or blocks of seats in the theatre: Ovid, *Amores* 3.2.19, *Ars Amatoria* 1.139.

<sup>97</sup> I.e. where the judge (a magistrate, or perhaps the emperor) is seated on a dais, not on a bench level with the court.

these things impair the force of the speech, cool the emotion, and make the judge feel that he is not being treated with sufficient respect. To cross over to the opposite benches is bad manners: Cassius Severus<sup>95</sup> wittily asked for ropes to be put in place<sup>96</sup> to protect him against an opponent who did this; and anyway, though the outward move may sometimes look energetic, the return journey is invariably a disaster.

Much of this advice will need to be modified by those who appear before tribunals.<sup>97</sup> Here, the face must be held more erect, so as to look towards the presiding judge, and Gestures must be higher up, again for his benefit. There are other differences which will occur to everyone without my mentioning them. Again, my general advice does not wholly apply to pleaders who speak from their seats;<sup>98</sup> this is common in minor cases, it allows no scope for vehemence in Delivery, and some faults are unavoidable. If you are sitting on the left of the judge, you *must* put your right foot forward,<sup>99</sup> while if you are on his other side many Gestures must be made towards the left, so that they are directed to the judge. I note that many people rise to their feet at the close of every sentence, and that some even take frequent little walks; it is for them to decide whether this is appropriate. When they do this, anyway, they are no longer speaking from their seat.

As for taking drink or food in the course of a speech—which many used to do, and some still do—may this be far from my orator's thoughts! If a man cannot sustain the burden of speaking without this, it is not such an unhappy fate

<sup>98</sup> See 11.1.44.

<sup>99</sup> Against the rule given above, § 124.

miserum est non agere potiusque multo quam et operis et hominum contemptum fateri.

- 137 Cultus non est proprius oratoris aliquis, sed magis in oratore conspicitur. Quare sit, ut in omnibus honestis debet esse, splendidus et virilis: nam et toga et calceus et capillus tam nimia cura quam neglegentia sunt reprimenda. Est aliquid in amictu quod ipsum aliquatenus temporum condicione mutatum est: nam veteribus nulli sinus, perquam breves post illos fuerunt. Itaque etiam gestu necesse est usos esse in principiis eos alio quorum brachium, sicut Graecorum, veste continebatur: sed nos de praesentibus loquimur. Cui lati clavi ius non erit, ita cingatur ut tunicae prioribus oris infra genua paulum, posterioribus ad medios poplites usque perveniant: nam infra mulierum est, supra centurionum. Ut purpurae recte descendant levis cura est, notatur interim neglegentia. Latum habentium clavum modus est ut sit paulum cinctis summissior.

<sup>100</sup> Wearing the toga properly demanded care and skill. It was a large piece of woollen material, roughly semicircular, with a width of up to 5.5 metres and a depth of about 1.75 metres. It was first thrown over the left shoulder, so that about 1.5 metres hung down in front and about twice as much behind. This longer portion was then carried round under the right arm and then diagonally across the chest (like a *balteus*, "belt") and over the left shoulder again. A section of this portion hanging in front formed the *sinus* ("fold"), and was held up by the left arm. The original length hanging in front from the left shoulder was now *below* the rest. A portion of it was then pulled up from above and allowed to hang over the edge of the *balteus*: it was now called the *umbo* ("boss"), and was the last part to be adjusted. Q. advises that this should be big enough to balance the part of the toga that hung

to stop pleading altogether; that would be far preferable to displaying your contempt for your work and for society.

### Dress

As for dress, there is no special form for the orator, but his is noticed more. As with all men of standing, it should be distinguished and masculine. Toga,<sup>100</sup> shoes, and hair invite criticism both for too much care and for not enough. There are some features of dress which have themselves changed somewhat with the changing times. The ancients wore no *sinus* ("fold"), and their successors very short ones. Accordingly, as their arms (according to Greek custom) were kept within their clothes, they must have used different Gestures from ours in the Prooemium. But I am speaking of present conditions. A speaker who is not entitled to the Broad Stripe<sup>101</sup> should gird his tunic in such a way that its front edge falls a little below the knee, and the back edge reaches to the middle of the calf. Anything lower is for women; anything higher is for centurions. It is not difficult to make purple stripes hang properly; carelessness in this sometimes attracts criticism. The rule for wearers of the Broad Stripe is that it should be a little lower than the girt tunic would be.

from the left shoulder, and so help to keep it in place. See in general OCD<sup>3</sup>, s.v. toga. Statues (e.g. the Barberini Togatus, illustrated in J. Boardman, *Oxford History of Classical Art*, fig. 238) show what it looked like.

<sup>101</sup> A broad purple stripe on the *tunica* (which was then worn without a girdle) was a privilege of senators and their sons.

- Ipsam togam rutundam esse et apte caesam velim, aliter enim multis modis fiet enormis. Pars eius prior mediis cruribus optime terminatur, posterior eadem portione  
 140 altius qua cinctura. Sinus decentissimus si aliquo supra imam tunicam<sup>47</sup> fuerit, numquam certe sit inferior. Ille qui sub umero dextro ad sinistrum oblique ducitur velut balteus nec strangulet nec fluat. Pars togae quae postea imponitur sit inferior: nam ita et sedet melius et continetur. Subducenda etiam pars aliqua tunicae, ne ad lacertum in actu redeat: tum sinus iniciendus umero, cuius extremam  
 141 oram reiecisce non dedecet. Operiri autemumerum cum toto iugulo non oportet, alioqui amictus fiet angustus et dignitatem quae est in latitudine pectoris perdet. Sinistrum brachium eo usque adlevandum est ut quasi normalem illum angulum faciat, super quod ora ex toga duplex aequaliter sedeat.
- 142 Manus non impleatur anulis, praecipue medios articulos non transeuntibus: cuius erit habitus optimus adlevato pollice et digitis leviter inflexis, nisi si libellum tenebit—quod non utique captandum est: videtur enim fateri memoriae diffidentiam et ad multos gestus est impedimento.
- 143 Togam veteres ad calceos usque demittebant, ut Graeci pallium: idque ut fiat, qui de gestu scripserunt circa tempora illa, Plotius Nigidiusque, praecipunt. Quo magis

<sup>47</sup> *Spalding*: togam *B*

<sup>102</sup> I.e. the left hand, which supports the *sinus* and will be in full view. Note that it can be used to hold a book.

<sup>103</sup> I.e. the *himation*, a rectangular piece of cloth used as an outer garment: see *OCD*<sup>3</sup>, s.v. dress.

I should like the toga itself to be round, and well cut to fit; otherwise there are many ways in which it will be unshapely. It is best if the front reaches to the middle of the shin, while the back is higher, to correspond with the girdle of the tunic. The fold (*sinus*) is most becoming if it falls a little above the bottom of the tunic; it should certainly never be below it. The fold which passes obliquely across the body like a belt, under the right shoulder and over the left, must be neither too tight nor too loose. The part of the toga which is arranged last should fall lower; it sits better like that, and is held in place better. A part of the tunic should also be drawn back, so that it does not fall down on to the upper arm in the course of the pleading; the fold should then be thrown over the shoulder, and it is not unbecoming to turn back the edge of it. However, the shoulder and the whole throat should not be covered, or the dress will be tight and lose the dignity which a broad chest can give. The left arm should be raised just so far as to form a right angle, and over it the double edge produced by the toga should fall evenly.

The hand<sup>102</sup> should not be loaded with rings, especially any which do not go over the middle joint. The best position for the hand is with the thumb raised and the fingers slightly flexed, unless holding a book. (This is in any case not something you should choose to do, because it suggests lack of confidence in your memory, and it is a hindrance to a great many Gestures.)

The ancients used to let the toga fall right down to the heels, like the Greek pallium;<sup>103</sup> and this is recommended by Plotius and Nigidius, who wrote on *Gestures* at that

miror Plini Secundi docti hominis et in hoc utique libro paene etiam nimium curiosi persuasionem, qui solitum id facere Ciceronem velandorum varicum gratia tradit, cum hoc amictus genus in statu eorum quoque qui post Ciceronem fuerunt appareat.

144 Palliolum, sicut fascias quibus crura vestiuntur et focalia et aurium ligamenta, sola excusare potest valetudo.

Sed haec amictus observatio dum incipimus: procedente vero actu, iam paene ab initio narrationis, sinus ab umero recte velut sponte delabitur, et cum ad argumenta ac locos ventum est reicere a sinistro togam, deicere etiam, 145 si haereat, sinum convenit.<sup>48</sup> Laeva a faucibus ac summo pectore abducere licet: ardent enim iam omnia. Et ut vox vehementior ac magis varia est, sic amictus quoque habet actum quendam velut proeliantem. Itaque ut laevam involvere toga et incingi paene furiosum est, sinum vero in dextrum umerum ab imo reicere solutum ac delicatum (fiuntque adhuc peius aliqua), ita cur laxiorem sinum sinistro brachio non subiciamus? Habet enim acre quiddam atque expeditum et calori concitationique non inhabile.

147 Cum vero magna pars est exhausta orationis, utique adflante fortuna, paene omnia decent, sudor ipse et fatigatio et neglegentior amictus et soluta ac velut labens

<sup>48</sup> M.W.: conveniet B

<sup>104</sup> For Plotius Gallus, see on 2.4.42. P. Nigidius Figulus (praetor 58 BC) was a scholar and antiquarian: our passage (= fr. LXV Swoboda) is the only evidence we have for a work on gesture.

<sup>105</sup> Presumably the three long books called *Studiosus* (Pliny, *Epist.* 3.5) in which the elder Pliny traced the education of the

period.<sup>104</sup> I am therefore all the more surprised at a statement by Plinius Secundus, a man of real learning and in this book<sup>105</sup> at any rate precise to a fault. He says that Cicero used to wear his toga like this to conceal his varicose veins, although the fashion is to be seen also in statues of persons who lived after Cicero's time.

The short cloak, like leg-bandages, scarves, and ear-protectors, is only excusable by illness.

This close attention to dress applies only at the beginning of a speech. As it proceeds, almost by the beginning of the Narrative, it is quite proper for the fold to slip, apparently accidentally, off the shoulder; and when we come to Arguments and Commonplaces, it is quite proper to throw the toga back from the left shoulder, and even to let the fold down, if it tends to stay up. You can pull the toga away from the throat and the upper chest with the left hand, for everything is now hotting up. And just as the voice becomes more vehement and varied in tone, so the clothing gets into battle mode, as it were. Of course, wrapping your left hand in your toga and tying it round you is almost insane, and throwing back the fold from its bottom on to the right shoulder is foppish and effeminate, and indeed there are yet worse things than these; but why should we not tuck the looser part of the fold under the left arm? There is a keenness and readiness for action about this, not ill-adapted to the heat and excitement.

And when the great part of the speech is over, at least if fortune smiles upon us, almost anything goes—sweat, fatigue, disordered clothing, toga loose and falling off all

orator "from the cradle" (compare 3.1.21). Q. implies that some of his other works (the *Natural History* perhaps?) were less accurate.

- 148 undique toga. Quo magis miror hanc quoque succurrisse  
Plinio curam, ut ita sudario frontem siccari iuberet ne  
comae turbarentur, quas componi post paulum, sicuti dig-  
num erat, graviter et severe vetuit. Mihi vero illae quoque  
149 turbatae prae se ferre aliquid adfectus et ipsa oblivione  
curae huius commendari videntur. At si incipientibus aut  
paulum progressis decadat toga, non reponere eam prorsus  
neglegentis aut pigri aut quo modo debeat amiciri nescien-  
tis est.

- Haec sunt vel inlustramenta pronuntiationis vel vitia,  
150 quibus propositis multa cogitare debet orator. Primum  
quis, apud quos, quibus praesentibus sit acturus (nam ut  
dicere alia aliis et apud alios magis concessum est, sic  
etiam facere; neque eadem in voce gestu incessu apud  
principem senatum populum magistratus, privato publico  
iudicio, postulatione actione, similiter decent: quam dif-  
ferentiam subicere sibi quisque qui animum intenderit  
151 potest): tunc qua de re dicat et quid velit efficere.<sup>49</sup> Rei  
quadruplex observatio est: una in tota causa (sunt enim  
tristes hilares, sollicitae securae, grandes pusillae, ut vix  
umquam ita sollicitari partibus earum debeamus ut non et  
152 summae meminerimus): altera quae est in differentia par-  
tium, ut in prohoemio narratione argumentatione epilogo:

<sup>49</sup> efficere quid velit *B, transp. Winterbottom*

round. This makes me all the more surprised that Pliny thought it worth while to recommend drying the forehead with a towel in such a way as not to disturb the hair—although a little later he very properly, and with much gravity and sternness, forbids us to arrange it. Personally, I think that dishevelled hair has some emotional impact, and wins approval just because trouble seems to have been forgotten. However, if the toga falls down early in the speech, or after only a little while, failure to rearrange it is a sign of carelessness, laziness, or ignorance of how clothes should be worn.

*Delivery depends on circumstances and the type  
of Cause*

Such are the successes or failures of Delivery. Having grasped what these are, there remain many points which the orator must think of. (1) Who he is, whose court it is, and who is present. Permissible forms of behaviour, as of speaking, vary with speaker and audience. The same features of voice, Gesture, and walk are not equally appropriate to speaking before the emperor, the senate, the people, and the magistrates, in a private and in a public trial, in an application for a hearing and in an actual pleading. Anyone who sets his mind to it will be able to suggest the differences. (2) What is his subject, and what he wants to effect. As to subject, there are four considerations. (a) The nature of the Cause as a whole. It may be sad or amusing, alarming or unthreatening, important or trivial, so that we can hardly ever be preoccupied with any one part without also remembering the whole. (b) The difference of the parts—Prooemium, Narrative, Argumentation, Epilogue. (c) The



tertia in sententiis ipsis, in quibus secundum res et adfectus variantur omnia: quarta in verbis, quorum ut est vitiosa si effingere omnia velimus imitatio, ita quibusdam nisi sua natura redditur vis omnis aufertur.

153 Igitur in laudationibus, nisi si funebres erunt, gratiarum actione, exhortatione, similibus laeta et magnifica et sublimis est actio. Funebres contiones, consolationes, plerumque causae reorum tristes atque summissae. In senatu conservanda auctoritas, apud populum dignitas, in privatis modus.

De partibus causae et sententiis verbisque, quae sunt multiplicia, pluribus dicendum.

154 Tria autem praestare debet pronuntiatio, ut conciliet persuadeat moveat, quibus natura cohaeret ut etiam delectet.

155 Conciliatio fere aut commendatione morum, qui nescio quo modo ex voce etiam atque actione perlucet, aut orationis suavitate constat, persuadendi vis adfirmatione, quae interim plus ipsis probationibus valet. 'An ista,' inquit Calidio Cicero, 'si vera essent, sic a te dicerentur?' et: 'tan-

<sup>106</sup> Q. uses for Delivery the basic classifications that apply to oratory as a whole: the three *officia oratoris* and (in §§ 161–174) the five "parts" of a speech. Compare also 11.3.30. Note that Q. does not come to his promised discussion of the parts of a speech till § 161.

<sup>107</sup> *Fr. orat.* VI. 4 Schoell (*Brutus* 278); Crawford (1994) p. 151.

thoughts themselves, in which everything varies according to circumstances and emotions. (d) The words: while it is a mistake to try to represent everything by means of Gesture, some words lose their force altogether if their nature is not duly brought out.

(a) *Different kinds of Causes*

Thus (a) in Encomia (funeral orations excepted) and in speeches of thanks, exhortation, and the like, the Delivery is rich, splendid, and lofty. In funeral addresses, consolations, and in general the defence of accused persons, it is melancholy and subdued. In the senate, the tone must be authoritative; in addressing the people, dignified; in private cases, restrained.

We shall have to go into more detail concerning (b) the parts of a Cause, (c) the thoughts, and (d) the words, all of which present complex problems.

*The three main objects of Delivery*

Delivery however has to effect three objects: it must conciliate, persuade, and move.<sup>106</sup> That it should also give pleasure is a natural corollary of this.

(1) The power to conciliate comes generally either from acceptability of character (which shines through somehow also in the voice and the Delivery) or from charm of style.

(2) The power to persuade comes from confident assertion, which is sometimes more effective than the Proofs themselves. "If all this were true," says Cicero<sup>107</sup> to Calidius, "would you have said it like that?"—and again,

tum abest ut inflammare nostros animos: somnum isto loco vix tenebamus.' Fiducia igitur appareat et constantia, utique si auctoritas subest.

156 Movendi autem ratio aut in repraesentandis est aut imitandis adfectibus.

Ergo cum iudex in privatis aut praeco in publicis dicere de causa iusserit, leniter est consurgendum: tum in componenda toga vel, si necesse erit, etiam ex integro inicienda, dumtaxat in iudiciis (apud principem enim et magistratus et tribunalia non licebit) paulum est commorandum, ut et amictus sit decentior et protinus aliquid spatii ad cogitandum. Etiam cum ad iudicem nos converterimus et consultus praetor permiserit dicere, non protinus est erumpendum, sed danda brevis cogitationi mora: mire enim auditurum dicturi cura delectat et iudex se ipse componit. Hoc praecipit Homerus Ulixis exemplo, quem stetit oculus in terram defixis inmotoque sceptro priusquam illam eloquentiae procellam effunderet dicit. In hac cunctatione sunt quaedam non indecentes, ut appellant scaenici, morae: caput mulcere, manum intueri, infringere articulos, simulare conatum, suspiratione sollicitudinem fateri, aut quod quemque magis decet, et ea diutius si iudex nondum intendet animum. Status sit rectus, aequi et

<sup>106</sup> *Iliad* 3.216–224, a passage regularly cited (with *Iliad* 1.249) to illustrate the "three styles" (see 12.10.64). Ulysses' eloquence is "like a winter blizzard."

"Far from your setting us on fire, we could scarcely stay awake through that passage." So let your confidence and firmness be apparent, at least if you have the authority to back them.

(3) The power to move rests on realizing or imitating emotions.

*General advice on deportment when about to speak*

Accordingly, when the judge in private cases, or the court usher in public ones, calls upon us to speak on our Cause, we must get up without hurrying, and then spend a little time arranging the toga or, if need be, putting it on afresh—in the public courts, I mean, because this will not be allowed before the emperor, a magistrate, or a tribunal—so as both to make our dress more decent and to give ourselves a little time to think. Even when we turn to the judge and ask and receive the praetor's permission to speak, we must not burst out immediately, but allow a brief pause for reflection. Care in the speaker is very agreeable to the listener; and besides, the judge can settle himself down. Homer recommends this by the example of Ulysses,<sup>106</sup> whom he describes as standing with his eyes fixed on the ground and not moving his staff, before pouring forth his "blizzard" of eloquence. In this period of delay, some "stop-gaps," as the actors say, are not inappropriate: stroking the head, looking at the hand, cracking the fingers, pretending to summon up our energies, confessing nervousness by a sigh, or doing whatever suits our particular character; and this can go on for some time if the judge is not yet paying attention. The stance should be upright,

- diducti paulum pedes, vel procedens minimo momento sinister: genua recta, sic tamen ut non extendantur: umeri remissi, vultus severus, non maestus nec stupens nec languidus: braccia a latere modice remota, manus sinistra qualem supra demonstravi, dextra, cum iam incipiendum erit, paulum prolata ultra sinum gestu quam modestissimo, velut spectans quando incipiendum sit. Vitiosa enim sunt illa, intueri lacunaria, perfricare faciem et quasi improbam facere, tendere confidentia vultum aut quo sit magis torvus superciliis adstringere, capillos a fronte contra naturam retro agere, ut sit horror ille terribilis: tum, id quod Graeci frequentissime faciunt, crebro digitorum laborumque motu commentari, clare excreare, pedem alterum longe proferre, partem togae sinistra tenere, stare diductum vel rigidum vel supinum vel incurvum vel umeris, ut luctaturi solent, ad occipitium ductis.
- 161 Prohoemio frequentissime lenis convenit pronuntiatio: nihil enim est ad conciliandum gratius verecundia, non tamen semper: neque enim uno modo dicuntur exordia, ut docui. Plerumque tamen et vox temperata et gestus modestus et sedens umero toga et laterum lenis in utramque partem motus, eodem spectantibus oculis, decebit.
- 162 Narratio magis prolatam manum, amictum reciden-

<sup>109</sup> 11.3.142.

<sup>110</sup> 4.1.40.

feet balanced and somewhat apart, or with the left foot very slightly in front; knees straight, but not strained; shoulders relaxed, expression stern but not sad or blank or languid; arms slightly away from the side; left hand as described above;<sup>109</sup> right hand, when the time to begin approaches, slightly advanced beyond the fold of the toga, with a modest gesture, as though waiting for the moment to start. Mistakes include looking at the ceiling; wiping the blushes off your face and making it look shameless; thrusting your whole face forward with assurance; bending your brows to look fiercer; pushing your hair back from the forehead unnaturally, so as to produce that terrible bristling look. It is a mistake also to do what the Greeks so often do, namely to prepare for the speech with all sorts of movements of fingers and lips; or again to clear your throat loudly; or to put one foot well in front of the other, or hold a part of your toga in your left hand; or to stand with feet apart, stiffly, leaning back, bent forward, or with shoulders hunched up to the back of the head, like a wrestler about to engage.

(b) *The various parts of the speech*

(1) For the Prooemium, an even delivery is most often best (nothing beats modesty for earning goodwill) but not always, because (as I explained)<sup>110</sup> Prooemia are not all of the same kind. Generally, however, a quiet voice, modest Gestures, the toga firmly on the shoulder, and a gentle movement of the body to right and left, with a corresponding movement of the eyes, will prove appropriate.

(2) The Narrative will most often require the hand more extended, the clothes tending to slip off, Gestures

tem, gestum distinctum, vocem sermoni proximam et tantum acriorem, sonum simplicem frequentissime postulabit—in his dumtaxat: 'Q. enim Ligarius, cum esset in Africa nulla belli suspicio,' et 'A. Cluentius Habitus pater huiusce.' Aliud in eadem poscent adfectus, vel concitati: 'nubit genero socrus,' vel flebiles: 'constituitur in foro Laodiceae spectaculum acerbum et miserum toti Asiae provinciae.'

163 Maxime varia et multiplex actio est probationum: nam et proponere partiri interrogare sermoni sunt proxima, et contradictionem sumere: nam ea quoque diversa propositio est. Sed haec tamen aliquando inridentes, aliquando imitantes pronuntiamus.

164 Argumentatio plerumque agilior et acrior et instantior consentientem orationi postulat etiam gestum, id est fortem celeritatem. [Instandum quibusdam in partibus et densanda oratio.]<sup>50</sup>

165 Egressiones fere lenes et dulces et remissae, raptus Proserpinae, Siciliae descriptio, Cn. Pompei laus: neque est mirum minus habere contentione ea quae sunt extra quaestionem. Mollior nonnumquam cum reprehensione diversae partis imitatio: 'videbar videre alios intrantis, alios autem exeuntis, quosdam ex vino vacillantibus,' ubi non dissi-

<sup>50</sup> *del. D.A.R.: instandum <enim> M.W.*

<sup>111</sup> *Pro Ligario* 2.

<sup>112</sup> *Pro Cluentio* 11.

<sup>113</sup> *Ibid.* 14. <sup>114</sup> *In Verrem* 1.76.

<sup>115</sup> I.e. the reply to an argument which the opponent has put forward, including a quotation or parody of his words: compare *Declamationes minores* 338, and above, 5.13.28.

sharply distinguished, voice conversational, only a little sharper, and a natural tone—at least in passages like "For Quintus Ligarius, since there was no hint of war in Africa"<sup>111</sup> and "Aulus Cluentius Habitus, this man's father."<sup>112</sup> Emotional aspects of the Narrative will require a different approach, whether the emotion is indignation (as in "The mother-in-law marries the son-in-law")<sup>113</sup> or pathos ("There in the marketplace of Laodicea was set up a spectacle grievous and unhappy for the whole province of Asia").<sup>114</sup>

(3) It is in the Proofs that Delivery becomes particularly varied and complex. Proposition, Partition, and Interrogation have much in common with conversation, and so has taking up a Contradiction,<sup>115</sup> which is only a Proposition, though on the other side. (This indeed we sometimes deliver in a mocking tone, and sometimes mimicking our opponent.)

(4) The more active, energetic, and urgent Argumentation demands Gesture also that is appropriate to its style, that is to say a vigorous rapidity. [In some parts, we have to be insistent, and our style concentrated.]

(5) Digressions are generally smooth, pleasing, and relaxed: Rape of Proserpine, Description of Sicily, encomium of Pompey.<sup>116</sup> (It is not surprising that matters unconnected with the question at issue should have a less combative tone.) A more effeminate manner may sometimes be right for the critical portrayal of an adversary: "I seemed to see some coming in, some going out, some stag-

<sup>116</sup> *In Verrem* 4.106, 2.2; *Fr. orat.* VII 47 Schoell (Crawford (1994) p. 128); see also 9.2.55.

dens a voce permittitur gestus quoque, in utramque partem tenera quaedam, sed intra manus tamen et sine motu laterum, tralatio.

- 166 Accendendi iudicis plures sunt gradus. Summus ille et quo nullus est in oratore acutior: 'suscepto bello, Caesar, gesto iam etiam ex parte magna' (praedixit enim: 'quantum potero voce contendam ut populus hoc Romanus exaudiat'). Paulum inferior et habens aliquid iam iucunditatis: 'quid enim tuus ille, Tubero, in acie Pharsalica gladius agebat?' 167 Plenius adhuc et lentius ideoque dulcius: 'in coetu vero populi Romani, negotium publicum gerens': producenda omnia trahendaeque tum vocales aperiendaeque sunt fauces. Plenior tamen haec canali fluunt: 'vos, Albani tumuli atque luci.' Iam cantici quiddam habent sensimque resupina sunt: 'saxa atque solitudines voci respondent.' 168 Tales sunt illae inclinationes vocis quas invicem Demosthenes atque Aeschines exprobrant, non ideo improbandae: cum enim uterque alteri obiciat, palam est utrumque fecisse. Nam neque ille per Marathonis et Plataearum et Salaminis propugnatores recto sono iuravit, nec ille Thebas sermone deflevit.
- 169 Est his diversa vox et paene extra organum, cui Graeci

<sup>117</sup> *Fr. orat.* VI. 1 Schoell (Crawford (1994) p. 150).

<sup>118</sup> Before coming to the Epilogue, Q. diverges from his scheme to include emotional passages in any context.

<sup>119</sup> *Pro Ligario* 6–7. <sup>120</sup> *Ibid.* 9. <sup>121</sup> *Philippics* 2.63.

<sup>122</sup> *Pro Milone* 85. <sup>123</sup> *Pro Archia* 19.

<sup>124</sup> Demosthenes, *On the Crown* 291 ("raising his voice, exulting and screaming"), Aeschines, *Against Ctesiphon* 210 ("Why the tears? What's the shouting? What's this tone of voice?").

<sup>125</sup> *On the Crown* 208. See on 9.2.62.

gering from drink."<sup>117</sup> Here one is allowed a Gesture to match the voice, a gentle movement from side to side, but only of the hands, not the hips.

(6) There are several levels of tone with which the judge can be aroused.<sup>118</sup> (a) The highest—the most penetrating available to an orator—is to be heard in "When the war was begun, Caesar, indeed when it was almost done." (Note that he prefaced this with "I will strain my voice to its limits, so that the Roman people can hear.")<sup>119</sup> (b) Slightly lower, already with some touch of charm: "What was that sword of yours doing, Tubero, on the field of Pharsalus?"<sup>120</sup> (c) Fuller, slower, and so easier on the ear: "In an assembly of the Roman people, performing his official functions."<sup>121</sup> Everything is to be drawn out, the vowels lengthened, and the throat opened. (d) The stream flows fuller still in: "Ye hills and groves of Alba."<sup>122</sup> (e) There is something of a chanting effect in the gradual fall of "Rocks and deserts respond to the voice."<sup>123</sup> These are the sort of modulations of the voice which Demosthenes and Aeschines denounce in each other,<sup>124</sup> but they are not to be rejected on that account, because it is obvious, since each blames the other, that they both used them! Demosthenes surely did not use a normal range of voice to swear by the champions of Marathon and Plataea and Salamis;<sup>125</sup> nor did Aeschines weep for Thebes in a conversational tone.<sup>126</sup>

There is a totally different sound, almost beyond the normal range of the instrument, which the Greeks call

<sup>126</sup> *Against Ctesiphon* 133: "Thebes, Thebes, our neighbour city . . ."

nomen amaritudinis dederunt, supra<sup>51</sup> modum ac paene naturam vocis humanae acerba: 'quin compescitis vocem istam, indicem stultitiae, testem paucitatis?' Sed id quod excedere modum dixi in illa parte prima est: 'quin compescitis.'

- 170 Epilogus, si enumerationem rerum habet, desiderat quandam concisorum continuationem: si ad concitandos iudices est accommodatus, aliquid ex iis quae supra dixi: si placandos, inclinatam quandam lenitatem: si misericordia commovendos, flexum vocis et flebilem suavitatem, qua praecipue franguntur animi quaeque est maxime naturalis: nam etiam orbos viduasque videas in ipsis funeribus canoro quodam modo proclamantis. Hic etiam fusca illa vox, qualem Cicero fuisse in Antonio dicit, mire faciet: habet enim in se quod imitatur.<sup>52</sup> Duplex est tamen miseratio, altera cum invidia, qualis modo dicta de damnatione Philodami, altera cum deprecatione demissior. Quare, etiam si est in illis quoque cantus obscurior: 'in coetu vero populi Romani' (non enim haec rixantis modo dixit) et 'vos Albani tumuli' (neque enim quasi inclamaret aut testaretur locutus est), tamen infinito magis illa flexa et circumducta sunt: 'me miserum, me infelicem' et 'quid respondebo liberis meis?' et 'revocare tu me in patriam potuisti, Milo, per hos: ego te in eadem patria per eosdem retinere non potero?' et

<sup>51</sup> *edd.*: super B

<sup>52</sup> imitemur *edd.*

<sup>127</sup> It is not known what Greek word Q. has in mind: perhaps *πικρία* or *πικρότης*.

<sup>128</sup> Cicero, *Pro Rabirio perduellionis reo* 18.

<sup>129</sup> *Brutus* 141 (but with *subrauca* for Q.'s *fusca*).

<sup>130</sup> See 11.3.162.

"bitterness,"<sup>127</sup> an extraordinary harshness almost beyond the scope of the human voice: "Why do you not restrain these cries, the proof of your folly, the witness to your small numbers?"<sup>128</sup> (The extraordinary harshness of which I spoke is in the first words, *Quin compescitis*.)

(7) The Epilogue, if it contains a recapitulation of the facts, requires a series of short phrases; if it is designed to move the judges, it needs some of the features mentioned above; if to placate them, a quiet, low-pitched delivery; if to excite pity, inflections of voice and a tearful sweetness, which is both most likely to touch the heart and also very natural: you find bereaved parents and widows lamenting in a kind of singing tone at the actual funeral. In this context a "husky" voice, such as Cicero<sup>129</sup> says Antonius had, will do wonders, since it possesses the very quality we are trying to imitate. However, there are two kinds of appeals to pity, one involving indignation (as in the passage just quoted on the condemnation of Philodamus),<sup>130</sup> and one combined with an appeal and thus more subdued. Thus, although there is something of the "muffled song" also in "In the assembly of the Roman people"<sup>131</sup> (Cicero did not deliver these words in a brawling tone) and in "Ye hills of Alba"<sup>132</sup> (for he did not speak here as though he was appealing to the hills for help or asking them to bear witness), there are other passages which have infinitely more inflexion and modulation: "O miserable, unhappy me!" "What shall I reply to my children?" and "You had the power, Milo, to restore me to my country, with these men's help: can I not keep you in that same country with these same

<sup>131</sup> *Philippics* 2.63.

<sup>132</sup> *Pro Milone* 85.

cum bona C. Rabiri nummo<sup>53</sup> sestertio addicit: 'o meum miserum acerbumque praeconium.'

173 Illa quoque mire facit in peroratione velut deficientis dolore et fatigatione confessio, ut pro eodem Milone: 'sed finis sit, neque enim prae lacrimis iam loqui possum': quae similem verbis habere debent etiam pronuntiationem.

174 Possunt videri alia quoque huius partis atque officii: reos excitare, pueros attollere, propinquos producere, vestes laniare; sed suo loco dicta sunt.

Et quia in partibus causae talis est varietas, satis apparet accommodandam sententiis ipsis pronuntiationem, sicut ostendimus, sed verbis quoque, quod novissime dixi-  
175 ram, non semper, sed aliquando. An non haec<sup>54</sup> 'misellus' et 'pauperculus' summissa atque contracta, 'fortis' et 'vehemens' et 'latro' erecta et concitata voce dicendum est? Accedit enim vis et proprietates rebus tali adstipulatione.  
176 quae nisi adsit aliud vox, aliud animus ostendat. Quid quod eadem verba mutata pronuntiatione indicant adfirmant exprobrant negant mirantur indignantur interrogant in-  
rident elevant? Aliter enim dicitur

tu mihi quodcumque hoc regni

<sup>53</sup> Bentley: uno B

<sup>54</sup> Cf. 1.4.8: hoc Spalding

<sup>133</sup> These three quotations (in a changed order) are from *Pro Milone* 102. <sup>134</sup> *Pro Rabirio Postumo* 45.

<sup>135</sup> 105. <sup>136</sup> 6.1.30-35.

<sup>137</sup> For this division of the topic, see § 153. In discussing the "parts of speech" Q. has incidentally illustrated the relationship between Delivery and Thought.

<sup>138</sup> Diminutives: "poor little fellow," "little pauper."

<sup>139</sup> "Strong," "vehement," "brigand."

men's help?"<sup>133</sup>—and again, when he is describing how Rabirius' property was knocked down for a sestertius: "Alas for my sad, bitter auctioneer's work!"<sup>134</sup>

A confession of being overcome by grief and fatigue is also wonderfully effective in an Epilogue, as in *Pro Milone* again:<sup>135</sup> "Let this be the end; I can no longer speak for tears." This passage must be given a Delivery corresponding to the words.

It may be thought that there are other matters that belong to this part and to this function of an orator: calling forward the defendant, lifting up his children, leading forward his relatives, tearing one's clothes; but these have been discussed in their proper place.<sup>136</sup>

(c) Thoughts and (d) Words

Such being the variety required by the different parts of the Cause, it is clear enough that Delivery must be adapted to the thoughts themselves, as I have shown, but also to the words, as I said just now<sup>137</sup>—not always, however, but sometimes. Surely *misellus* and *pauperculus*<sup>138</sup> need to be uttered in a low, subdued voice, *fortis*, *vehemens*, and *latro*<sup>139</sup> in a lively, vigorous one? This kind of congruence lends additional force and appropriateness to the subject, and without it the voice and the mind will be making different statements. Again, if the Delivery is changed, the same words can suggest, affirm, reproach, deny, wonder, show indignation, ask a question, mock, or disparage! Consider the difference between:

Tu mihi quodcumque hoc regni

et

cantando tu illum?

et

tune ille Aeneas?

et

meque timoris  
argue tu, Drance,

et ne morer, intra se quisque vel hoc vel aliud quod volet  
per omnis adfectus verset: verum esse quod dicimus sciet.

- 177 Unum iam his adiciendum est: cum praecipue in ac-  
tione spectetur decorum, saepe aliud alios decere. Est  
enim latens quaedam in hoc ratio et inenarrabilis, et ut  
vere hoc dictum est, caput esse artis decere quod facias, ita  
178 id neque sine arte esse neque totum arte tradi potest. In  
quibusdam virtutes non habent gratiam, in quibusdam  
vitia ipsa delectant. Maximos actores comoediarum, De-  
metrium et Stratoclea, placere diversis virtutibus vidimus.  
Sed illud minus mirum, quod alter deos et iuvenes et bo-

<sup>140</sup> Vergil, *Aeneid* 1.78, *Eclogues* 3.24, *Aeneid* 1.617, 11.383–384. In the first passage, Aeolus addresses Juno deferentially—“You gave me this kingdom, such as it is”—and further *tu* clauses follow. The second example is contemptuous: “You beat *him* at singing!” In the third, Dido addresses Aeneas in wonder and surprise: “Are *you* the Aeneas . . . ?” The last is ironical and contemptuous: Turnus is saying: “Convict *me* of cowardice, Drances, *you* . . .” (when we know what a hero you are!).

<sup>141</sup> Cicero, *De oratore* 1.132. Note that Q. here returns to *de-*

and

Cantando *tu* illum

and

*Tune* ille Aeneas

and

meque timoris  
argue *tu*, Drance.<sup>140</sup>

In short, if the reader will take *tu* or any other word he chooses and, in his own mind, run it through the whole range of emotions, he will realize the truth of what I am saying.

There is just one thing still to add to all this. It is true that the main consideration in *Delivery* is what is becoming, but it is often the case that different things become different speakers. There is a hidden and inexplicable principle behind this and, though it has been truly said that “the main thing in art is that what one does should be becoming,”<sup>141</sup> this is something which is neither attainable without art nor wholly communicable by art. In some people, excellences have no charms; in some, their very faults are delightful. We have seen those great comic actors, Demetrius and Stratocles,<sup>142</sup> give pleasure by very different qualities. This is the less surprising, because one of them was very good at acting gods, young men, good

*corum*, the subject of 11.1: probably conscious “ring composition.”

<sup>142</sup> Juvenal 3.99 mentions these two together; we know nothing more about them.



179 nos patres servosque et matronas et graves anus optime,  
alter acres senes, callidos servos, parasitos, lenones et om-  
nia agitatoria melius—fuit enim natura diversa: nam vox  
quoque Demetri iucundior, illius acrior erat; adnotandae  
magis proprietates, quae transferri non poterant. Manus  
iactare et dulces exclamationes theatri causa producere et  
ingrediendo ventum concipere veste et nonnumquam dex-  
tro latere facere gestus, quod neminem alium, Demetrium  
180 decuit (namque in haec omnia statura et mira specie ad-  
iuvabatur): illum cursus et agilitas et vel parum conveniens  
personae risus, quem non ignarus rationis populo dabat, et  
contracta etiam cervicula. Quidquid horum alter fecisset,  
foedissimum videretur. Quare norit se quisque, nec tan-  
tum ex communibus praeceptis sed etiam ex natura sua  
181 capiat consilium formandae actionis. Neque illud tamen  
est nefas, ut aliquem vel omnia vel plura deceant.

Huius quoque loci clausula sit eadem necesse est quae  
ceterorum est, regnare maxime modum: non enim comoe-  
dum esse, sed oratorem volo. Quare neque in gestu perse-  
quemur omnis argutias nec in loquendo distinctionibus  
182 temporibus adfectionibus moleste utemur. Ut si sit in scae-  
na dicendum:

quid igitur faciam? non eam ne nunc quidem,  
cum arcessor ultro? an potius ita me comparem,  
non perpeti meretricum contumelias?

<sup>143</sup> An allusion to the Delphic maxim *Γνῶθι σεαυτόν*, "Know yourself."

<sup>144</sup> Terence, *Eunuchus* 46–48.

fathers and good slaves, married ladies, and respectable  
old women; the other did better with angry old men, shift-  
y slaves, parasites, pimps, and all the livelier characters.  
Their natural gifts in fact differed. Demetrius had the  
pleasanter voice, Stratocles the more penetrating. Even  
more noteworthy were the peculiar, and non-transferable,  
features of each. The hand-waving, the lovely long cries  
meant for the audience, the way of catching the wind in his  
clothes as he came on, the occasional expressive move-  
ment of his right side—all this became Demetrius, and no  
one else; his height and his good looks helped him in it all.  
What became Stratocles, on the other hand, was his speed  
and agility, his laugh (not always in keeping with the char-  
acter, but a conscious concession to the audience), and  
even his hunched-up neck. If the other had done any of  
these things, it would have seemed a disgusting perfor-  
mance. So let everyone "know himself,"<sup>143</sup> and take coun-  
sel in forming his Delivery not only from general rules, but  
from his own nature. Not that there is anything fundamen-  
tally wrong in a man's finding everything, or at least most  
things, appropriate for him to do.

The conclusion of this discussion must be the same as  
that of all the others: moderation rules. I do not want my  
pupil to be a comic actor, but an orator. We shall not there-  
fore pursue all the refinements of Gesture, nor shall we be  
pedantic about punctuation, timing, or emotional tone in  
speaking. Suppose one had to say the following lines on the  
stage:

So what shall I do? Not go, not even now  
when I am sent for? Or, rather, steel myself  
not to put up with insults from these harlots?<sup>144</sup>

183 Hic enim dubitationis moras, vocis flexus, varias manus, diversos nutus actor adhibebit. Aliud oratio sapit nec vult nimium esse condita: actione enim constat, non imitatione. Quare non inmerito reprehenditur pronuntiatio vultuosa et gesticulationibus molesta et vocis mutationibus resultans. Nec inutiliter ex Graecis veteres transtulerunt, quod ab iis sumptum Laenas Popilius posuit, esse hanc †mocosam†<sup>55</sup> actionem.

184 Optime igitur idem qui omnia Cicero praeceperat quae supra ex Oratore posui: quibus similia in Bruto de M. Antonio dicit. Sed iam recepta est actio paulo agitatior et exigitur et quibusdam partibus convenit, ita tamen temperanda ne, dum actoris captamus elegantiam, perdamus viri boni et gravis auctoritatem.

<sup>55</sup> inotiosam *recc.*: negotiosam *Halm*

Here, the actor will introduce pauses for hesitation, inflections of voice, various hand-gestures, and different movements of the head. Oratory has a different flavour: it does not wish to be too highly spiced, because it is a real activity, not an imitation. There is therefore every reason to object to a Delivery that pulls faces, irritates by its gesticulations, or jumps from one tone of voice to another. It was a useful borrowing that our old writers took from the Greek, and Popilius Laenas from them, to call this sort of pleading *mocosa*.<sup>145</sup>

Cicero, as in all things, gives the best advice on this: I quoted above from the *Orator*, and there are similar remarks about Marcus Antonius in the *Brutus*.<sup>146</sup> Nowadays, however, a somewhat more agitated style of Delivery is regarded as acceptable, and is indeed appropriate in some contexts; but it needs to be under control, lest, in our eagerness to pursue the elegance of the performer, we lose the authority of the good and grave man.<sup>147</sup>

<sup>145</sup> For Laenas, see 10.7.32. *Mocosam* remains mysterious. If the word is right, it seems to be a hybrid of Greek μῶκος ("sneer" or "insulting joke": Simplicius, *Comm. on Epictetus' Enchiridion* 301, 17 Hadot) and the Latin ending -osus. But "sneering" is not the sense required. The plausible emendations *inotiosam* and *negotiosam* both translate Greek ἄσχαλος, and mean "fussy" or "busy."

<sup>146</sup> 141.

<sup>147</sup> Q. thus prepares the transition to the next book, which is to be about the finished orator.